

Jared Polis Governor

Dr. Angie Paccione Executive Director

## **SMART Act Report**

CRS 2-7-201 through CRS 2-7-205 CRS 2-7-201 through CRS 2-7-205 Colorado Department of Higher Education (CDHE) to report on the progress toward meeting the goals put forth in the Colorado Commission on Higher Education's master plan, described in section 23-1-108 (1.5).

In October 2017, the Colorado Commission on Higher Education (CCHE) released its statewide master plan, *Colorado Rises:* Advancing Education and Talent Development. This plan is designed to support the Commission's vision of all Coloradans having an education beyond high school to pursue their dreams and improve our communities. To accomplish these goals, CDHE advocates for, develops policies, and supports students to maximize higher education opportunities for all.

Colorado Rises reaffirms a statewide credential attainment goal of moving from today's 56.9 percent credential attainment rate to 66 percent by 2025. The plan includes four strategic priorities, which serve as the Department's strategic priorities.

The master plan lays out a series of metrics and pursuant to 23-1-108 (1.5)(f). The department works with public institutions of higher education to affirm and measure their specific contribution to improving these measures.

These efforts inform this report. More in-depth and up-to-date data are available on the Colorado Rises Dashboard: <a href="http://masterplan.highered.colorado.gov/dashboard/">http://masterplan.highered.colorado.gov/dashboard/</a>.

### STATEWIDE PRIORITIES FOR HIGHER EDUCATION - An Urgent Call to Action

To retain Colorado's position as one of the top state economies in the United States, we must supply homegrown talent to fill jobs that will keep the state attractive to both businesses and residents. By 2020, nearly three in four jobs in the state will require some education beyond high school<sup>i</sup>, and 97 percent of "top jobs" in Colorado will require a credential of value. Because only 56.9 percent<sup>iii</sup> of Coloradans hold a credential today, our work to increase postsecondary attainment levels equitably, strengthen communities and ensure the level of talent development needed has never been more urgent.

CCHE identified four strategic goals within the scope of the public postsecondary system to make this plan actionable:

STRATEGIC GOAL #1: Increase Credential Completion

STRATEGIC GOAL #2: Erase Equity Gaps

STRATEGIC GOAL #3: Improve Student Success

STRATEGIC GOAL #4: Commit to Cost Containment and Innovation

This report includes select performance metrics related to these four strategic goals. An  $\bigcirc$  indicates positive progress in the most recent year. While the state has made progress in most areas, to reach our 2025 goal, we must accelerate progress.

#### COLORADO COMMISSION ON HIGHER EDUCATION MASTER PLAN - Colorado Rises

The Colorado Rises Goal – Reaching 66 Percent Statewide Attainment by 2025: While formidable, we're making progress toward our overarching goal. Colorado established an attainment goal in 2012, and since then, attainment in the state has risen from 53.5 percent to 56.9 percent. Assuming continuation of current trends in Colorado's population, migration and credential production rates by all institutions—public and private—the Commission projects Colorado would achieve a statewide attainment rate of 60.9 percent by 2025<sup>iv</sup>. Factoring the state's growing minority population, the Commission has also set an ambitious equity attainment goal of 66 percent for African American, Hispanic and Native American populations; current statewide attainment levels are 40.3 percent for African Americans, 28.6 percent for Hispanics, and 33.2 percent for Native Americans<sup>v</sup>. By pursuing the following four strategies and tracking the associated metrics, Colorado will begin to close the gap and expand educational opportunity.



### STRATEGIC GOAL #1—Increase Credential Completion:

The first strategic goal demands we significantly increase the number of credentials that students earn over an eight-year period and credential completion in high-demand areas, such as STEM and teacher preparation.

# OVERALL UNDERGRADUATE CREDENTIAL PRODUCTION INCREASED YEAR OVER YEAR BETWEEN ACADEMIC YEARS 2010-11 AND 2017-18<sup>vi</sup>.

Academic Year	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14	2014-15	2015-16	2016-17	2017-18	
Credentials	39,015	41,956	46,023	48,643	49,816	51,477	56,019	5,7353	
1-Year Change		8%	10%	6%	2%	3%	9%	2%	$\odot$
Certificates	10,361	11,567	13,859	15,604	15,741	16,217	20,069	20,214	
1-Year Change		12%	20%	13%	1%	3%	24%	1%	$\bigcirc$

- Credential production increased between academic years 2010-11 and 2017-18 but slowed in the most recent year. To reach our goals, the state must maintain 4.5 percent growth *and* produce approximately 100,000 additional credentials between now and 2025. Though credential production is increasing, Colorado must accelerate trends to meet our goals.
- Colorado must increase certificate production to align with workforce demands. Between academic years 2013-14 and 2017-18, certificate production grew 30 percent, significantly contributing toward this goal.

# AFTER AN INCREASE IN ACADEMIC YEAR 2016-17 UNDERGRADUATE EDUCATOR PREPARATION CREDENTIALS DECLINED AGAIN IN 2017-18; STEM CREDENTIALS INCREASED EACH ACADEMIC YEAR BETWEEN 2010-11 AND 2017-18.

Academic Year	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14	2014-15	2015-16	2016-17	2017-18	
Educator Prep. Credentialsvii	3,274	3,078	2,858	2,704	2,563	2,472	2,674	2,553	
1-Year Change		-6%	-7%	-5%	-5%	-4%	8%	-4.5%	
STEM Credentialsviii	6,497	7,378	7,991	8,823	9,598	9,958	10,695	11,172	
1-Year Change		13%	8%	10%	9%	4%	7%	4%	$\bigcirc$



### STRATEGIC GOAL #2—Erase Equity Gaps:

With our state's changing demographics, the goal of 66 percent is unattainable if we do not make major progress on erasing equity gaps—the racial disparities in educational attainment. Of states with at least one million Latinxs, Colorado ranks the highest in terms of equity gaps<sup>ix</sup>. *Colorado Rises* aims to raise African American, Hispanic and Native American students to 66 percent along with their white counterparts.

# AFRICAN AMERICAN AND HISPANIC STUDENTS SAW INCREASED CREDENTIAL COMPLETION BETWEEN ACADEMIC YEARS 2011-12 AND 2017-18 BUT ARE NOT ON TRACK TO MEET MASTER PLAN GOALS; PELL STUDENT CREDENTIAL COMPLETION DECLINED IN 2017-18\*.

Academic Year	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14	2014-15	2015-16	2016-17	2017-18	
Race/Ethnicity									
African American	1299	1,453	1,449	1,741	1,844	1,809	1,942	2,057	
1-Year Change		12%	0%	20%	6%	-2%	7%	6%	$\bigcirc$
Hispanic	4,775	5,438	5,761	7,096	7,755	8,307	9,402	10,281	
1-Year Change		14%	6%	23%	9%	7%	13%	9%	$\odot$
Native American	414	437	485	511	532	502	565	536	
1-Year Change		6%	11%	5%	4%	-6%	13%	-5%	

Colorado has significant work to do to improve outcomes for Coloradans of color. Current projections suggest that by 2025, only
48 percent of African American students, 35 percent of Hispanic students and 31 percent of Native American students will earn
a postsecondary credential<sup>xi</sup>. The department released an equity toolkit for inclusive teaching to support additional progress.

### PELL STUDENT CREDENTIAL COMPLETION DECLINED IN 2017-18<sup>xii.</sup>

Academic Year	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14	2014-15	2015-16	2016-17	2017-18	
Income									
Pell Eligible	11,881	13,015	14,280	15,310	15,291	15,268	15,452	14,926	
1-Year Change		10%	10%	7%	0%	0%	1%	-3%	

• 2018-19 changes to the performance funding model to weight Pell students more heavily may also reverse these trends.



## STRATEGIC GOAL #3—Improve Student Success:

To graduate more students, Colorado must focus on promoting and improving successful student momentum.

# RETENTION RATES, THE NUMBER OF STUDENTS WHO START AT A COLLEGE ONE FALL AND ENROLL THE NEXT FALL, STAYED RELATIVELY CONSTANT BETWEEN THE FALL 2010 AND THE FALL 2018 COHORTS\*iii.

Cohort	Fall 10-11	Fall 11-12	Fall 12-13	Fall 13-14	Fall 14-15	Fall 15-16	Fall 16-17	Fall 17- 18	
Fall to Fall Retention	69.5%	68.7%	70.4%	70.1%	72.0%	72.50%	71.7%	73.0%	
1-Year Change		-1%	2%	0%	3%	1%	-1%	2%	$\bigcirc$

# AT TWO-YEAR INSTITUTIONS, GRADUATION RATES INCREASED BETWEEN THE FALL 2009 AND FALL 2015 COHORTS. AT FOUR-YEAR INSTITUTIONS BOTH ON-TIME GRADUATION RATES AND 150 PERCENT-TIME GRADUATION RATES INCREASED OVER TIME BUT THERE WAS A NOTICABLE JUMP FOR THE 2012 COHORTXIV.

2-Year Institutions									
Cohort Year	Fall 08	Fall 09	Fall 10	Fall 11	Fall 12	Fall 13	Fall 14	Fall 15	
3 Year Graduation	25.1%	20.9%	21.0%	20.8%	21.8%	21.6%	24.3%	26.9%	$\odot$
4-Year Institutions									
Cohort Year	Fall 05	Fall 06	Fall 07	Fall 08	Fall 09	Fall 10	Fall 11	Fall 12	
4 Year Graduation	29.0%	31.2%	31.8%	32.8%	32.9%	34.2%	34.5%	36.1%	$\bigcirc$
6 Year Graduation	57.5%	58.7%	59.3%	59.2%	60.2%	59.9%	59.3%	61.8%	Ø

In the most recent year of data, there are significant increases in both retention and completion rates.

# DEVELOPMENTAL EDUCATION COURSE ENROLLMENTS AND CREDIT HOURS ENROLLED HAVE DECLINED SIGNIFICANTLY SINCE COLORADO'S 2012 DEVELOPMENTAL EDUCATION REFORM EFFORTS\*V.

Academic Year	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14	2014-15	2015-16	2016-17	2017-18	
Students Enrolled	N/A	44,813	41,366	32,464	25,947	23,395	21,046	18,435	
1-Year Change			-8%	-22%	-20%	-10%	-2%	-12%	$\bigcirc$
<b>Remedial Credit Hours</b>	258,937	262,343	243,579	177,260	140,007	124,536	111,272	98,910	_
1-Year Change		1%	-7%	-27%	-21%	-11%	-11%	-11%	$\bigcirc$

• The master plan outlines a goal of reducing remediation rates and the number of students who graduate from high school in Colorado needing remediation has hovered around 35 percent over the last four years.<sup>xvi</sup> However, since Colorado began redesigning remediation in 2012, replacing it with an alternative type of remediation called supplemental academic instruction, the number of remedial credits and enrollments declined dramatically. In 2018 the Department helped support a bill to ensure the number of students enrolled in developmental education continues to decline.

#### ENROLLMENT IN AND CREDENTIALS OBTAINED THROUGH CONCURRENT ENROLLMENT CONTINUE TO GROWXVII.

Academic Year	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14	2014-15	2015-16	2016-17	2017-18	
Enrollment								
Students in Concurrent Enrollment	13,928	17,873	20,488	23,127	25,534	28,290	30,979	
1-Year Change		28%	15%	13%	10%	11%	9.5%	
Student in Any Dual Enrollment	24,079	26,935	31,092	35,713	38,519	41,857	45,787	
1-Year Change		12%	15%	15%	8%	9%	9.4%	
Outcomes								
Credentials Produced	483	775	956	1,231	1,491	2,017	2,758	
1-Year Change		60%	23%	29%	21%	35%	36.7%	

• Dual enrollment<sup>xviii</sup> improves student retention and completion by allowing high school students to earn college credit that can reduce their time-to-degree. In the years reported, Colorado saw significant growth in both enrollment and completion of dual enrollment courses and programs.



### STRATEGIC GOAL #4—Invest in Affordability and Innovation:

Increase public investment and encourage models that reduce costs and time-to-degree.

## WHILE MEDIAN FAMILY INCOME EXPERIENCED 25 PERCENT GROWTH BETWEEN FISCAL YEARS 2011-12 AND 2018-19, RESIDENT TUITION HAS OUTPACED INCOME WITH A GROWTH RATE OF 48 PERCENT.

Fiscal Year	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14	2014-15	2015-16	2016-17	2017-18	2018-19
Resident Tuitionxix	\$5,902	\$6,513	\$7,028	\$7,338	\$7,666	\$8,144	\$8,519	\$8,758
1-Year Change		10%	8%	4%	4%	6%	5%	3%
Median Family Incomexx	\$58,629	\$57,255	\$67,912	\$60,940	\$66,596	\$70,566	\$74,984	\$73,034
1-Year Change		-2%	19%	-10%	9%	6%	6%	-3%
Tuition as a Percent of Income	10.1%	11.4%	10.3%	12.0%	11.5%	11.5%	11.4%	12.0%

# OVER THE LAST THREE YEARS THE PERCENT OF ASSOCIATES DEGREE GRADUATES WITH DEBT HAS DECLINED, THE PERCENT OF BACHELOR'S DEGREE GRADUATED WITH DEBT GREW SLIGHTLY IN 2017-18<sup>xxi</sup>.

<b>Graduation Year</b>	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14	2014-15	2015-16	2016-17	2017-18	
Associate Degree Graduate with Debt	52.8%	66.3%	65.5%	63.4%	60.4%	58.1%	55.1%	$\bigcirc$
Bachelor's Degree Graduate with Debt	58.9%	69.2%	70.2%	68.9%	67.4%	65.5%	66.9%	

• State investment in higher education has allowed tuition increases to grow at a slower rate in recent years. The number of students with debt also decreased between fiscal year 2012-13 and 2017-18 for associates degree graduates but grew slightly between 2016-17 and 2017-18 for bachelor's degree graduates. Still, costs are outpacing income. The legislature must continue to chip away at historic disinvestment to ensure higher education is more affordable for students and families.

### INNOVATION

- The Department awarded \$550,000 in funding to support Open Education Resources adoption. In the first year of the OER Grant Program, institutional grantees are projecting savings of more than \$3.4 million in textbook costs to the students.
- In 2019, the Department received \$12 million from the U.S. Department of Labor (Department) to scale 5,000 health care apprenticeships in Colorado's higher education system. The state has also secured \$4.2 million in matching funds from health care partners across the state. This innovative program will help reduce the cost to a degree from thousands of Coloradans.

All SMART Act Sources are available in a separate document. Email Chloe Mugg, Legislative Liaison (chloe.mugg@dhe.state.co.us)

i Source: Recovery: Job Growth and Education Requirements Through 2020, State Report. Anthony P. Carnevale, Center on Education and the Workforce, Georgetown University, 2013.

ii Source: The Colorado Talent Pipeline Report. Colorado Workforce Development Council, issued 2016.

iii Source: American Community Survey Data retrieved online through the U.S. Census Data Farrett Tool

 $<sup>^{</sup>m iv}$  Source: Colorado State Demographers Office projections using 2016 ACS estimates

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>v</sup> Source: American Community Survey Data retrieved online through the U.S. Census Data Farrett Tool

 $<sup>^{</sup>m vi}$  Source: SURDS Data. Also available on the CDHE Master Plan Dashboard.

 $<sup>^{</sup>m vii}$  Source: 2018 Educator Preparation Report, Colorado Department of Higher Education

viii Source: SURDS Data. STEM credentials include all those CIP codes listed as STEM on lists maintained by NSF and ICE. It also includes institution-specific STEM designations. Post-baccalaureate certificates were removed changing the numbers slightly from 2018.

ix Source: SURDS Data. STEM credentials include all those CIP codes listed as STEM on lists maintained by NSF and ICE. It also includes institution-specific STEM designations. Post-baccalaureate certificates were removed changing the numbers slightly from 2018.

x Source: SURDS Data. Also available on the CDHE Master Plan Dashboard. Credential counts in this report have been adjusted from the 2017 SMART Act report to remove post-bachelor's and master's certificates.

xi Source: Colorado State Demographers Office projections using 2016 ACS estimates

xii Source: SURDS Data. Also available on the CDHE Master Plan Dashboard. Credential counts in this report have been adjusted from the 2017 SMART Act report to remove post-bachelor's and master's certificates.

xiii Source: SURDS Data, also available in the annual Retention Rate Report

 $<sup>^{</sup>m xiv}$  Source: SURDS Data, also available in annual Graduation Rate Report

xv Source: Methodology is based on Table 7 from the Legislative Report on Developmental Education for the High School Class of 2015. It includes all students enrolled in remedial education (not just recent high school graduates) and include only traditional remediation courses (not SAI). 2016-17 data was changed from the 2018 SMART Act to remove summer enrollments, making it consistent with other year calculations.

xvi Source: Legislative Report on Developmental Education for the High School Class of 2016, Colorado Department of Higher Education

xvii Source: SURDS and CDE, also available in the annual Concurrent Enrollment Report

xviii In Colorado, dual enrollment refers to any program where high school students take college-level courses for credit while Concurrent Enrollment refers only to the state supported Concurrent Enrollment program defined in statute.

xix Source: DHE Tuition and Fees Data

xx Source: U.S. Census Bureau

xxixxi Source: DHE Financial Aid Data