

**Minutes of the Colorado Commission on Higher Education (CCHE) Meeting
Legislative Services Building – Hearing Room A
February 5, 2016**

I. OPENING BUSINESS

Chairman Monte Moses called the meeting to order at 1:05pm.

A. Presentation

Mr. Brandon Busted, Executive Director of Education and Workforce Development, at Gallup, Inc., presented to the Commission the Gallup Study: Great Jobs and Great Lives. The key points of the presentation were:

- There exists a need to continue to examine the role that outstanding educational experience has on individual perceptions on the components of a “great life.” A “great life” can be quantified into the following components of satisfaction; purpose, social, financial, community and physical.
- Gallup has developed data showing that individual experiences in the college/university setting have an impact on their post-graduate success. In particular, those graduates who had experiences involving “experiential and deep learning” in higher education have a higher likelihood of being engaged in their work (59% vs. 38%)
- Exposure to people with different backgrounds and viewpoints continue to link to individual opinions about the value of their education. For those that had extensive exposure to people from different backgrounds, they reported higher levels (by a factor of 2.2 times) of believing that their education was worth the cost. There also exists a correlation between lower student loan debt and individual perceptions of the value of their higher education experience.

B. Attendance

Chairman Moses, Vice Chair Colon, Commissioners John Anderson, Maia Babbs, Renny Fagan, Vanecia Kerr, Paula Sandoval and BJ Scott attended the meeting. Commissioner Tom McGimpsey attended via conference call. Also in attendance were CCHE Advisory Committee members Senator Nancy Todd, Senator Chris Holbert, Representative Jeni Arndt, Wayne Artis, Mark Cavanaugh, Tyrel Jacobsen, Gretchen Morgan and Melissa Wagner.

C. Minutes

Commissioner Anderson moved to approve the minutes of the December 3, 2015 CCHE meeting. The motion was seconded by Commissioner McGimpsey and passed unanimously.

D. Chair, Vice Chair, Commissioners and Advisor Reports

- **Fiscal Affairs and Audit Subcommittee** – Commissioner Scott, Chair of the Fiscal Affairs and Audit Subcommittee, told the Commissioner that at their last meeting on January 22, 2016, the concentration was on edits to the Tuition Policy.
- **Student & Academic Affairs Subcommittee** - Commissioner Anderson, Chairman of the Student & Academic Affairs Subcommittee, reported the Standing Committee met today. The discussion centered on the Prior Learning Assessment and P-Tech. Commissioner Anderson announced the Admissions tool will be usable in March.

E. Executive Director Report

Lt. Governor Joe Garcia, Executive Director, reported the following to the Commission:

- The Governor’s introductions at the State of the State address included a higher ed/concurrent enrollment student.
- At the December 10, 2015 Joint Budget Committee (JBC) hearing for Higher Education, the Department clarified the tuition policy request and roles of Governing Boards, CCHE, Governor and General Assembly. At the February 9, 2016 meeting with JBC staff will further explain the tuition policy.
- BEL Commission trip to Zurich: The trip was led by the Governor and Noel Ginsberg, BEL Commission Chair. Participants included employers (CEOs), non-profits, foundations, K-12, and higher education representatives. The Department’s Chief Operating Office, Jennifer Sobanet attended. The delegation learned the Swiss system that deeply connects business and education and will develop a strategic plan and begin pilots in Colorado.
- **Division Updates:**
Legislative Affairs:
 - Policy Project: Extended Studies/COF Stipend/Service Area/Regional Education Provider. Staff has been working with the Attorney General’s office to review the Department’s Service Area policies to ensure they are up to date and in alignment with statute, which were last revised in 1995. A draft has been prepared with these suggested edits and updates from the AG’s office. The intention is to work this through the normal “stakeholder” process; Academic Officers, CFOs, and CEOs before bringing the updates edits to the Commission. Rep Coram has inquired

about the Service Area policy with an interest about the continued appropriateness of having delineated areas.

Student Success and Academic Affairs:

- Two P-Tech schools were approved and included in a press announcement on January 12, 2106; St. Vrain Valley School District, Front Range Community College, and IBM (Computer Information Systems) will open in fall 2016, as well as James Irwin Charter School (El Paso County School District 49 as authorizer), Pikes Peak Community College, Bal Seal Engineering, and the Housing and Building Association of Colorado Springs. Two additional applications for P-Tech schools that were received after the priority application deadline are currently being reviewed, and if approved, will also begin in fall 2016; Adams12, Front Range Community College, and Level (3) Communications (Computer Information Systems) and Eagle County, Colorado Mountain College, Colorado Mountain Medical (Med Tech).
- The Scholarship Initiative board approved 10 counties and two institutions of higher education during the January 20, 2016 meeting. The total amount committed during the meeting was \$1,915,759, bringing the total scholarship commitments, to-date, to \$3,233,166. With philanthropic matches, that amount is expected to grow to over \$6.4 million and is estimated to benefit over 2,000 students.
- Attainment Gap Update: We are accepting letters of intent for our Collective Impact Initiative grants until Feb. 26. We expect to receive approximately 40 letters of intent. The review team will select 8-10 applicants to receive additional support to complete their initiative proposal. Three or four awardees will receive funding (\$150,000 per year, with an expected \$50,000 community match) plus technical assistance and the Scholarship Initiative will provide \$450,000 annually to support the grant. The Department is seeking additional funding from national partners to support the technical assistance portion of the grants.

Finance:

- Already in this Legislative Session, the Department has received requests for fiscal notes for nearly 80 bills which involves coordinating with experts at the institutions via over 850 emails.
- Cat Olukotun is the budget team's new lead analyst. Her assignment includes the capital budget and financial policies related to the administration of the College Opportunity Fund among other responsibilities.
- Mike Evans, the Department's Controller for the past ten years, retired in mid-January. I want to recognize Emma Beck, Junior Policy Analyst, for taking on additional responsibilities during the transition.

Advocacy and Outreach:

- College Friday, coming up on April 29, 2016, is sponsored by College In Colorado. We will have more details at future meetings but this is our annual day to wear our college sweatshirts as a way of sparking conversations with students. The legislature and 9news and others have taken part in past years.

F. Public Comment

Dr. John Lanning, Professor Emeritus/Outreach Liaison at University of Colorado Denver; Dr. Mike Lightner, Vice President for Academic Affairs, University of Colorado System; Dr. Patrick Tally, Interim Assistant Dean for Curricular Affairs at University of Colorado Boulder; and Dr. Steven Leigh, Dean of Arts & Sciences at University of Colorado Boulder addressed the Commission. The four representatives of the University of Colorado noted that all University of Colorado campuses currently support prior learning assessments and all award credit for AP and IB already. A concern was that to take any exam, AP, IB, CLEP, etc., without verifying that the exam adequately assesses the appropriate content and competencies is illogical and inconsistent with current gtPathways practice. The University of Colorado representatives concluded, "...without compelling data showing improved graduation rates, decreased times to degree or lower cost of degree, we do not see the value in a blanket policy and ask that the Commission not pass the CDHE recommended AP/IB policy."

Ken Woods, Executive Director of Higher Education and Jason Langdon, Senior Director, at the College Board provided research that indicates the awarding of credit for AP does raise completion rates and can shorten time to degree.

Frank Watrous, Senior Policy Analyst with The Bell Policy Center, reinforced the Bell's continuing opposition to the Commission's tuition recommendation for 2016-17 (or for any other year) that would give governing boards full tuition authority, with no restrictions, if appropriations are flat or declining. Instead, they urge that the recommendation and the policy be amended through Commission action or through the legislative process to set similar parameters around tuition increases and require similar accountability mechanisms for governing boards regardless of whether appropriations are increasing, flat, or declining.

II. Consent Items

- A. Recommend Approval of New GT Pathways Courses – Maia Blom**
- B. Recommend Approval of Master of Arts in Strategic Communication Design at University of Colorado Boulder – Dr. Ian Macgillivray**
- C. Recommend Approval of Nine Proposed Bachelor Degrees at Metropolitan State University of Denver – Dr. Ian Macgillivray**
- D. Recommend Approval of Master of Arts in Teaching Diverse Learners at University of Northern Colorado – Dr. Ian Macgillivray**
- E. Recommend Approval of Master in Communication and Media Management at Colorado State University – Dr. Ian Macgillivray**
- F. Recommend Approval of Bachelor of Science in Human Dimensions of Natural Resources at Colorado State University – Dr. Ian Macgillivray**

- G. Recommend Approval of Bachelor of Arts in Inclusive Elementary Education at University of Colorado Colorado Springs – Dr. Ian Macgillivray & Dr. Robert Mitchell**
- H. Recommend Approval of Administrator Licensure Program at Western State Colorado University– Dr. Robert Mitchell**
- I. Degree Authorization Act - Recommendation for Renewal of Authorization – Heather DeLange**
- J. FY 2016-17 Student Budget Parameters – Andrew Rauch**
- K. Recommend Approval of Master of Arts in Multilingual Education at University of Northern Colorado – Dr. Ian MacGillivray**

Commissioner Fagan moved to approve consent items A through K. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Sandoval and unanimously passed.

III. Discussion Items

- A. Legislative Update –** Kachina Weaver, Chief Policy Officer and Legislative Liaison, updated the Commission on the status of current legislation in a detailed handout.
- B. Tuition Policy –** Tuition Policies—Diane Duffy, Chief Financial Officer, and Todd Haggerty, Lead Finance Analyst, provided information on recommended policy revisions to Commission Policy Section VI, Part C “Tuition and Fees.” Mr. Haggerty highlighted recommended changes to Commission policies to clearly outline the Commission’s role and processes and procedures for establishing the tuition increase limit and governing board request for additional flexibility. He also explained that the Chief Financial Officers discussed and provided feedback on the proposed changes at their December and January meetings. The Fiscal Affairs and Audit Committee of the Commission reviewed the proposal on January 22, 2016. Mr. Haggerty added that, in addition to the February meeting, the Commission will have the tuition policy as discussion item for March. Final action will likely take place at the April meeting.

Mr. Haggerty then walked through the proposed changes to the policy. Chairman Moses and Commissioner Sandoval both asked about the General Assembly’s opinion on the Commission policy. Mr. Haggerty responded that the Department would have a better understanding of the General Assembly’s view on the policy following the Lt. Governor’s presentation to the Joint Budget Committee on February 9, 2016. Chairman Moses also inquired about general themes surrounding affordability. In response, Mr. Haggerty explained that staff have told legislators that the greatest impact on affordability is time to degree and programs like concurrent enrollment and prior learning assessment play a strong role in shortening time to degree.

Commissioner Colon asked for a clarification to the recommended policy change as it related to the Governor’s contingency request. Mr. Haggerty explained the Governor’s contingency request and noted that he will make the change in the next version of the tuition policy.

Mr. Haggarty concluded his comments by reiterating that the Commission will receive the tuition policy as discussion items in February and March. Final action will likely take place at the April meeting. He emphasized that the revisions are based on the CCHE and Governor's tuition policy proposal that is being considered by the 2016 General Assembly and that the proposed CCHE policy revisions assumes the General Assembly will concur with the proposal. If the General Assembly does not concur with the proposal and takes a different approach, the tuition policy will need to be adjusted accordingly.

IV. Action Items

- A. Postsecondary And Workforce Readiness Definition – CDE Revision –** Carl Einhaus, Director of Student Affairs, informed the Commission that the Colorado Board of Education, on December 9, 2015, approved the following changes to the Postsecondary and Workforce Readiness definition to read as follows:

“Colorado high school graduates demonstrate the knowledge and skills (competencies) needed to succeed in postsecondary settings and to advance in career pathways as lifelong learners and contributing citizens.”

This definition is being brought before the Commission for approval.

Commissioner Anderson moved to approve the new definition of Postsecondary and Workforce Readiness. The motion was seconded by Commissioner McGimpsey and unanimously passed.

- B. Prior Learning Assessment: Recommendation for Phase 1, Goal 1 – Advance Placement & International Baccalaureate Cut Scores for General Education Credit –** Dr. Russ Meyer, Interim Chief Student Success and Academic Affairs Office, and Dr. Ian Macgillivray, Director of Academic Affairs, presented the agenda item on Prior Learning Assessment and proposed amended language to Recommendation 1 on page 6 of 35. Dr. Macgillivray proposed this sentence be added to the end of Recommendation 1: *“The Department, in collaboration with the institutions, may make exceptions in rare cases where the content of an exam may not meet GT Pathways requirements, such as with GT-AH4 World Language, which can be met only with the equivalent of 200-level coursework.”* Commissioners approved this language unanimously.

Commissioner Babbs pointed out that one of the examples provided by the University of Colorado representatives, a calculus course, had only 8 students in it. Dr. Macgillivray stated that calculus is not a good example because it is rarely used for general education credit and, if a student is taking calculus, then it is most likely because it is a course required by the major, and faculty will set cut scores for credit as it applies to major courses.

Commissioners discussed that the evidence and data presented is not always clear but that it points to adopting 3 cut score on AP and 4 cut score on IB as statewide cut scores for general education credit. There was discussion around tracking student data to ensure that the new cut scores are not lowering student success

rates. Department staff pointed out that tracking student data to ensure the policy is working as intended is in Phase 3 of the Commission-approved process from its May 8, 2015 meeting. The question was asked if advisors can advise students that even though they meet or exceed the minimum cut score it may be in the student's best interest to take the course on campus to ensure they do well in subsequent coursework. Dr. Macgillivray pointed out that institutions can and currently do this and proposed this 5th recommendation: "Institutions may advise students with PLA credits that the student may be more successful in subsequent coursework if they take the college course but the institution may not require the student take the college course."

Vice Chair Colon moved to approve the amendment. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Sandoval. The motion passed with a vote of seven for and two against.

Commissioner Scott moved to approve amendments to recommendations 1-4, including the 5th recommendation, as regards to Advanced Placement and International Baccalaureate cut scores for general education credit, and approve delaying Goals 1 & 3 until its April 2016 meeting and Goals 2 & 4 until late 2016. The motion was seconded by Vice Chair Colon and unanimously passed.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 4:20pm.