

**Minutes of the Colorado Commission on Higher Education (CCHE) Meeting
Red Rocks Community College
December 3, 2015**

I. OPENING BUSINESS

Chairman Monte Moses called the meeting to order at 1:00pm.

Commissioner Scott read a resolution honoring University of Colorado-Colorado Springs Officer Garrett Swasey, slain during a shooting at a Colorado Springs Planned Parenthood office, on November 27, 2015.

Commissioner Kaufman moved to approve the resolution for Officer Swasey. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Anderson and passed unanimously.

A. Attendance

Chairman Moses, Vice Chair Colon, Commissioners John Anderson, Maia Babbs, Renny Fagan, Jeanette Garcia, Richard Kaufman, Vanecia Kerr, Tom McGimpsey, Paula Sandoval and BJ Scott attended the meeting. Also in attendance were CCHE Advisory Committee members Wayne Artis, Mark Cavanaugh, Tyrel Jacobsen, and Melissa Wagner.

B. Minutes

Commissioner Garcia moved to approve the minutes of the October 29, 2015 CCHE meeting. The motion was seconded by Vice Chair Colon and passed unanimously.

C. Welcome by Dr. Michele Haney, President of Red Rocks Community College.

D. Chair, Vice Chair, Commissioners and Advisor Reports

Chairman Moses reported his attendance at the Guided Pathways to Success Summit.

The Chairman extended the Commission's appreciation to Executive Director, Lt. Governor Joe Garcia, as he moves to a new role as CEO of the Western Interstate Commission for Higher Education (WICHE). He

thanked the Lt. Governor for the years of hard work on behalf of the Commission and wished him well in his role with WICHE.

Chairman Moses also announced Dr. Rhonda Epper, Chief Student Success and Academic Affairs Officer at the Department, had been named the Provost and Vice President of Academic Affairs of the University of Colorado Denver campus, effective January 1, 2016, and thanked her for her service.

- **Fiscal Affairs and Audit Subcommittee** – Commissioner Scott, Chair of the Fiscal Affairs and Audit Subcommittee, announced their next meeting on January 20, 2016. The committee has sent forth several recommendations that have been acted on, that include the state tuition policies, the funding allocation model and capital priorities projects. At the January meeting the committee will be addressing the cash funded list and the capital projects.
- **Student & Academic Affairs Subcommittee** - Commissioner Anderson, Chairman of the Student & Academic Affairs Subcommittee reported the Standing Committee on Student Success & Academic Affairs met today. Their key projects are: remediation; strategies for student success; Complete College America; and, Guided Pathways for 2016. He suggested that the Guided Pathways should be an ongoing effort for both math pathways and gtPathways.

CCHE Advisor Wayne Artis mentioned that the math pathways and stopping college algebra as the default course for students, will be on the General Education Council meeting agenda for action on December 7, 2014.

- Commissioner Garcia requested that the Department add a link for the College Scorecard to the Commissioner's dashboard.

E. Executive Director Report

Lt. Governor Joe Garcia, Executive Director, reported the following to the Commission:

- Today's CCHE meeting is an intentional pivot from the work in previous meetings, the implementation of HB 1319, to the work on the Completion Agenda:
 - Close the Attainment Gap
 - Get adults back into college
 - Affordability - time to degree and data to show progress
- The Attainment Gap Roundtable discussion will be December 8th.
- **Division Updates:**

Student Success and Academic Affairs:

- The Lt. Governor complimented outgoing Chief Student Success and Academic Affairs officer, Dr. Rhonda Epper, who led the State's efforts to focus attention on time to degree, such as Guided Pathways to Success and the Prior Learning Assessment (PLA) Policy, COSI, closing the attainment gap, concurrent enrollment, Gear Up, and the Colorado Challenge, among many other efforts. The position was posted on November 30 and the department is actively recruiting potential replacements.
- The review process for the two P-TECH applications received is ending and the Department should have recommendations for approval by the end of December. If approved, the P-TECH schools would begin operation in fall 2016. Both the Executive Director of Higher Education and the Commissioner of Education will need to approve the P-TECH schools.
- A LEAN process for Concurrent Enrollment is taking place the week of December 14-18. Ten Concurrent Enrollment experts from Colorado secondary and post-secondary organizations will be participating in the week long effort. Carl Einhaus, Director of Student Affairs, will be participating. This will produce effective changes in Concurrent Enrollment operations and reporting, as well as assist in offering constructive input and direction toward any proposed CE legislation during the upcoming session.

Finance:

- The Finance Team is working on CCHE policies that include guidance for the proposed Tuition Accountability Plans. They will provide proposed policies at the February CCHE meeting and anticipate Tuition Accountability plans (if there is increased General Fund) in the March/April meetings. Staff will report on the tuition rates set by the governing boards at the June meeting.
- The Joint Budget Committee analyst briefing is December 10. The JBC higher education hearings are scheduled for January 5. During the hearing process, the JBC hears from the Executive Director on behalf of the CCHE and Department and each of the institutions.
- On December 2, the Finance Team hosted a peer-to-peer learning exchange with staff from nine other states focused on State Higher Education Finance Policies. This effort was funded by the Lumina Foundation.

Advocacy and Outreach:

- The Commission received an email from Heather Delange on November 10th informing them that Westwood College had come to the DHE offices to let the Department know of the announcement that they would be closing all of their colleges nation-wide. The Department is confident that that they are handling this closure in a responsible and well-thought out manner. Westwood will continue to be monitored.

Data and Research:

- The Colorado Department of Higher Education will be partnering with AIR, Gallup Inc., and the US Chamber of Commerce to launch the next round of a Colorado public tool for postsecondary education. The initiative is called Transforming Higher Education Outcomes. This is the next phase of the prior College Measures partnership and last year's Ed Pays website and report. The new version will add a component on Return on Investment. The initiative is being funded through USA Funds and Colorado is one of two states that will be releasing a new tool in 2016. The first meeting was held yesterday with education leaders, local partners and business at the table. Commissioner Vanecia Kerr was in attendance.

Legislative Affairs:

- The Lt. Governor and Kachina Weaver, Chief Policy Officer, continue to meet with legislative leaders to share the changes made to the funding allocation formula and why; explain the new tuition policy and its direct link to general fund investment; and the many innovative initiatives we are engaged in to reduce time-to-degree, keep costs down, and increase student success. Ms. Weaver is meeting with caucus staff and members of the House and Senate education committees to have these same conversations.
- December 14th, the Department will be presenting the progress made, as required by the SMART Act, to a meeting of the joint Senate and House Education Committees.
- January 5th will be higher education's annual presentation to the Joint Budget Committee.

F. Public Comment

Frank Watrous, Senior Policy Analyst with The Bell Policy Center, restated the Center's continuing support for the Prior Learning Assessment/Credit agenda item, commended the Talent Pipeline Report and reinforced the vital role of financial aid in helping students and families

II. Consent Items

- A. Two Year Capital Cash Funded Program List – Andrew Rauch**
- B. Five Year Capital Cash Funded Program List – Andrew Rauch**
- C. Program Plan Approval for Arapahoe Community College – Andrew Rauch**
- D. Recommend Approval of Bachelor of Arts in Public Service at the University of Colorado Denver - Dr. Ian Macgillivray**
- E. Recommend Approval of Bachelor of Science in Sustainable Systems Engineering at Metropolitan State University of Denver– Dr. Ian Macgillivray**
- F. Degree Authorization Act – Recommendation of Approval for the Renewal of Authorization – Heather DeLange**

G. Recommend Approval of the Revised 2016 Commission Meeting Schedule – Suzanne Stark

Commissioner Scott moved to approve consent items A through G. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Sandoval and unanimously passed.

III. Presentation Item

- A. Mr. David Goff, Dean of the Colorado School of Public Health, gave a presentation on the collaboration in Colorado's Higher Education System between the University of Colorado, Colorado State University and the University of Northern Colorado. Colorado School of Public Health is the oldest collaborative school of public health in the country. Their mission is to improve the health of the public through their educational mission, their research mission and partner with community based organizations for the greater good.
- B. Shelley Banker, Deputy Director of the Colorado Opportunity Scholarship Initiative, provided an update.
- The Colorado Opportunity Scholarship Initiative has been making marked progress since its inception. Created with the goal of establishing a statewide network of student support and scholarship programs, approximately \$13.8 million in state funds will leverage \$7 million in private philanthropic funds.
 - To-date the Initiative has accomplished the following:
 - \$6.8 million in two-year awards granted to 28 organizations across the state that work with students to improve access, persistence, and completion of a postsecondary credential. Grantees will be submitting year-end reports by December 31. Evaluations and an executive summary of reports will be completed by an evaluator by mid-February 2016.
 - \$7 million of COSI funds are being matched 1:1 with local programs dollars to provide new scholarships. These matching funds will be used for scholarships to Colorado students who attend Colorado public institutions of higher education and whose family income is 250% or less of PELL eligibility.
 - Formalized State Administrative rules administering the Initiative, which establish the eligibility criteria for students and community partner programs to participate, and convened nearly 100 program administrators and counselors to discuss student success best practices and to identify opportunities for collaboration. (*Fall 2015*)
 - Hosted large grantee symposium (Summer 2015) and four regional meetings (Fall 2015) for program grantees to discuss student success best practices and collaborate.
 - The Scholarship Initiative will continue to help smaller communities access scholarship funds, and plans to publish a community toolkit to assist smaller communities.

IV. Discussion Items

- A. Prior Learning Assessment (PLA): Recommendations for Phase 1, Goal 1-Advanced Placement & International Baccalaureate Cut Scores for General Education Credit** – Dr. Rhonda Epper and Dr. Ian Macgillivray, Director of Academic Affairs, presented recommendations of the Constituent Review Team for Phase 1, Goal 1 of the Commission’s process for a statewide policy on prior learning assessment. They explained that staff held five webinars for faculty, divided by content area, in September 2015 to consider cut scores for the most common AP and IB exams. The Constituent Review Team met to consider the recommendations collected from the institutions and faculty. They explained the CRT’s recommendations to the Commission for Phase 1, Goal 1. They asked for the Commission’s guidance on what to do when one institution awards more credit than another and a student transfers and feels like they lost credit. Commissioners Anderson and Moses agreed that the institutions should try to work that out but staff shouldn’t let that issue get in the way of moving forward in the PLA process. These recommendations will come back to the Commission in February 2016 for approval. For other next steps, Dr. Macgillivray noted that the March 2016 deadline for CLEP and DSST scores, as well as challenge exams, could probably be met but requested that the goals for portfolio assessment and military/veteran student success be delayed until late 2016. No commissioners objected to that proposed revised timeline.

Michael Lightner, Vice President for Student Affairs at the University of Colorado, stated that the University of Colorado has supported the use of prior learning assessment for decades. He talked about two principles that are sometimes neglected in discussion of PLA. First is the collective diversity among higher education institutions. The University has concerns that a broad-brush decision of common PLA cut scores minimizes and devalues the different roles and missions of our institutions. The second principle is the fundamental responsibility of the faculty in setting the content, standards and requirement of courses and degrees. The University is concerned that there has been minimal faculty involvement in the current PLA process and that faculty responsibility for program requirements has not been sufficiently acknowledged.

- B. Completion Progress Report** Dr. Beth Bean, Chief Research Officer, Luke Banaszak, Data Management and Research Analyst, and Michael Vente, Research and Policy Analyst, presented the Colorado Completion Progress Report to the commissioners. Dr. Bean began the presentation by providing the commissioners with a description of the report’s components.

The report provided a progress update on how Colorado is performing on the goals outlined in the statewide Master plan, Colorado Competes: A Completion Agenda for Higher Education. The first section of the report focuses on credential completion and closing the attainment gap by institution. The second section of the report examines progress on the performance contract metrics by institutional governing board. Each public college or university profile shows trending graduation rates; completion rates, and enrollment, retention and completion by race and ethnicity; and whether the institutions at the governing board level are achieving or making progress towards achieving the goal metrics established in their performance contracts.

Dr. Bean described Colorado's 66% credential attainment goal and the work that number of degrees that Colorado institutions must produce on a yearly basis in order to meet that goal. Despite population growth, in order to reach 66% of the population with a credential, an additional 94,000 plus degrees are needed by 2025. While private colleges and institutions account for 25% of degree production, Colorado public colleges and universities will need to generate over 70,000 additional credentials. Based upon current average degree production of about 55,000 degrees per year, an additional 8.3 percent increase in credentials awarded is needed to meet our 66% attainment goal. An annual increase of 8.3 percent equates to about 4,000 additional degrees in 2016 and compounds to over 9,000 additional credentials by 2025. The Commissioners had a lengthy conversation regarding the additional degrees needed to meet the attainment goal by 2025. The number of credentials needed per year is different than originally reported in the Master Plan, which stated about a 1K degree production increase per year. Chair Moses asked for a one pager that further explains the number of degrees needed as the commissioners want to fully understand and be able to speak to where we currently are and where we need to be to meet the 66% attainment goal.

Dr. Bean also addressed closing the attainment gap from an equity perspective. An important component of closing the attainment gap is highlighting disparities in attainment between ethnic groups. Inspired by the work from the Center of Urban Education at the University of Southern California, CDHE staff developed statewide equity indices and scorecards for Colorado. Mr. Vente provided the commissioners with an overview of the methodology used to develop these indices.

Mr. Banaszak presented the dashboards developed for each Colorado public institution which show trending graduation rates; completion rates, enrollment, retention and completion by race and ethnicity. He also described the attainment gap momentum points outlined in each dashboard. He explained the process by which these points were developed and the presentation of the points as annual percent change. There was a little confusion over some of the charts and the information they presented so Chair Moses also asked for a one pager explaining the methodology of each chart.

Dr. Bean provided the Commissioners with a brief historical overview of SB 11-52 and the performance contracts that were developed with each governing board. She also outlined the overarching goals developed for the performance contracts including increasing attainment, improving student success, reducing gaps, and restoring fiscal balance. She shared the statewide progress that has been made on each of these goals and explained the dashboards that have been developed for each governing board's metrics.

C. Talent Pipeline Report - Dr. Lauren Victor, Research and Policy Analyst, provided an overview of the 2015 Colorado Talent Pipeline Report. This report highlights trends in Colorado's talent pipeline and how these may impact the current and future workforce pool. It also looks at labor data to better understand where in-demand credentials and skills exist. Collectively, this information helps inform the prioritization of education and training strategies.

Highlights of the report included:

- As a result of findings from the previous year’s report, the focus was on a closer examination of achievement gaps by race and ethnicity.
- If the educational outcomes of underserved students are generally lower than that of other students at the primary and secondary school levels, then these students are often not adequately prepared to tackle the demands of rigorous postsecondary programs, and therefore such substantial gaps in foundational skills can lead to distinct racial/ethnic underrepresentation in highly technical postsecondary programs and careers.
- Poverty impacts student performance across all races; however, even when controlling for income, performance gaps still exist for students of color for measures across the educational spectrum.
- Often the focus is on discussion on the Hispanic population, especially because it is a large and growing segment of our state that will change the composition of our future workforce.
- In light of trying to understand future implications of Colorado’s changing demographics, the state demographer’s office provided initial analysis for this report, projecting education levels for Colorado’s adult population 10 and 20 years out.
- Part of the analysis looks at labor market data to understand what Top Jobs look like in Colorado—jobs that have above average growth, high annual openings and typically offer a living wage. What we find is that jobs that meet these filters are highly concentrated in IT, skilled trades, business/finance, and in healthcare. Nearly all of the jobs that make this list typically require some level of formalized training or education—whether an apprenticeship, certificate or degree.

D. Postsecondary and Workforce Readiness Definition – Aims Community College Revision – Dr. Beth Bean informed the Commission that Senate Bill 11-52 directed the Commissioners to approve institutions of higher education’s performance contracts. Once approved, institutions were given a two year period in which they could make modifications to the metrics in the contracts. Aims Community College is recommending a modification to one of their metrics.

Dr. Geri Anderson, Provost of Aims Community College, requested their metric for developmental education be modified to reflect what is currently occurring on their campus. At Aims CC, 80 percent of their students are going through the developmental sequence within two semesters instead of four. They would like to change the original language of the metric that states students completing their final developmental education course will then moving to college level work. The modification is to remove the *final developmental education course* and be changed to *students will complete their developmental work when required and successfully complete their college level course work in English and math*. Dr. Bean said the Department approves this change.

Vice Chair Colon moved to approve the modification to Aims Community College's performance contract. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Anderson and passed unanimously.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 4:00pm.