

Minutes of the Colorado Commission on Higher Education (CCHE) Meeting
Otero Junior College, La Junta, Colorado
June 7, 2012

Chairman Percy called the meeting to order at 1:15pm.

Chairman Hereford Percy, Vice Chairman Dick Kaufman, Commissioners Jeanette Garcia, Happy Haynes Dr. Monte Moses, Jim Polsfut and Regina Rodriguez were in attendance. Commissioner Patty Pacey attended via teleconference. Also in attendance were CCHE Advisory Committee members Michael Mincic, Dr. Frank Novotny. Ruth Annette Carter attended via teleconference.

Commissioner Moses moved to approve the minutes of the May 4, 2012 CCHE meeting. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Garcia and passed unanimously.

Jim Rizzuto, President of Otero Junior College (OJC) welcomed the Commissioners to the campus. He informed the Commission that the campus has 39 full time faculty members, over 100 employees and a student population between 1,200 and 1,300. He stated that the minority student population is between 28 and 30%, enabling the school to be a Title V school (Hispanic Serving Institution). Traditional students make up the majority, 55-60%, of the student population. President Rizzuto also stated that in a rural school full time faculty are more the norm than adjunct faculty. Seventy percent of the faculty at OJC is full time. Lt. Governor Garcia let the Commission know that a new reciprocity agreement between New Mexico and Colorado includes OJC for the first time.

CHAIRMAN, COMMISSIONER AND ADVISORS REPORTS

Vice Chairman Kaufman reported that he had attended, along with Chairman Percy and Commissioner Pacey, the Master Planning meeting with institutional representatives on May 23. Dr. Gianneschi, in his discussion item, went into the details and outcome of that meeting.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR REPORT

Lt. Governor Joe Garcia, Executive Director of the Colorado Department of Higher Education, reported that he and Dr. Ian Macgillivray, Assistant Deputy Director for Academic Affairs, met with members of the College Coalition for the Educational Advancement of Latinos (CoCEAL) regarding the letter sent to the Commission outlining their recommendation for the master planning process. The Lt. Governor and Dr. Macgillivray let the CoCEAL leadership know what was being done currently in the draft master plan that addressed their recommendations and the steps taken outside of the master plan that were consistent with their recommendations.

The Lt. Governor also spoke about Metropolitan State University of Denver's (Metro State) proposal to create a new category on non-residential tuition targeted at undocumented students who are graduates of Colorado high schools. Although the CCHE has supported the ASSET bill

which was proposed yet defeated each legislative session over the last three years, neither the Commission nor the Department advised Metro State whether this proposal was legally appropriate or politically viable. Metro State has been making an effort the past several years to become what OJC is, a Hispanic Serving Institution, which would give them access to certain Title V federal grant funds.

Commissioner Polsfut reiterated that neither he nor the Commission will take a position on Metro State's proposal.

Chairman Percy asked the Commission to vote on supporting the edited resolution declaring 2013 be the Year of the Student, as presented at the May CCHE meeting by Great Education Colorado.

Commissioner Moses moved to support the resolution. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Rodriguez and unanimously passed.

PRESENTATION ITEM

The Association of Student Persistence in Colorado Public Higher Education with Colorado Student Assessment Program (CSAP) Scores And The Admission Eligibility Index

Dr. Robert Reichardt, R-Squared Research, LLC presented to the Commission. In 2012, the Colorado Department of Higher Education contracted with R-Squared Research, LLC through Augenblick, Palaich and Associates, to complete a study examining the association of student persistence with CSAP scores and the Admission Eligibility Index.

Dr. Reichardt sought to understand 1) the predictability of CSAP scores and higher education attendance 2) the predictability of CSAP scores and persistence 3) the use of the Admissions Eligibility Index 4) the predictability power of CSAP scores compared to the Admission Index and 5) the relationship between the Admission Index and persistence. He used the Colorado Department of Higher Education's Student Unit Record Data System and data from the Colorado Department of Education to address the above research questions. Results suggest that 1) persistence at both two-and four-year institutions varies based upon student demographics and institutions; 2) that CSAP scores and Admission Index are correlated and comparable predictors of persistence; and, 3) that persistence rates of "window admission" students vary by institutions.

CONSENT ITEMS

Approval of FTE Enrollment Allocations for New Mexico-Colorado Tuition Reciprocity Agreement for 2012-2015

Correction to CCHE Policy IV: Statewide Extended Studies

Fiscal Year 2013 COF Eligibility for Extended Studies Programs

Colorado Community College System Two-Year Degrees With Academic Designations In Anthropology And French

Commissioner Rodriguez moved to approve the consent items. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Garcia and unanimously passed.

ACTION ITEMS

Recommendation to Reverse the CCHE Decision that Prohibits Institutions of Higher Education from Offering Bachelor's Degrees in Elementary Education

Dr. Ian Macgillivray, Assistant Deputy Director For Academic Affairs, presented this item to the Commissioners. A study done in 1986 argued that degrees in early childhood and elementary education lacked academic rigor. As a result of that study, the CCHE voted to require for a bachelor's degree, teacher candidates must major in a subject field such as English or math, which were believed to be rigorous degrees. DHE staff polled deans and directors of educator preparation programs at the institutions to gather opinions on whether the 1986 CCHE decision should be reversed. The majority of institutions were in favor of the reversal; two of the eleven institutions polled opposed the reversal.

Commissioner Haynes moved to reverse the Commission's previous decision and allow institutions of higher education to offer bachelor's degrees in Elementary Education. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Garcia and unanimously passed.

Degree Authorization Act: Recommendation for Status Change – Rocky Vista University – College of Osteopathic Medicine

Heather DeLange, Academic Policy Officer, presented this item to the Commission. In 2007, the CCHE voted to approve initial authorization of Rocky Vista University – College of Osteopathic Medicine. Since that time, Rocky Vista University has continued to work toward accreditation with two accrediting agencies: the American Osteopathic Association Commission on Osteopathic College Accreditation (COCA) and the Higher Learning Commission of the North Central Association of Colleges and Schools (HLC). In April 2012, COCA awarded Rocky Vista University accreditation. Rocky Vista University's receipt of accreditation from (COCA) qualifies the institution to move from Probationary Status to Full Authorization.

Commissioner Polsfut moved to approve the status change for Rocky Vista University to Full Authorization. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Moses and unanimously passed.

Degree Authorization Act: Recommendation of Authorization Revocation for Colorado University of Commerce

Heather DeLange, reported to the Commission that Colorado University of Commerce (CUC) received probationary authorization, as a start up in Colorado, in 2007. The HLC, in May 2010, asked CUC to submit a letter of intent for accreditation, which the HLC later denied, thereby ceasing the accreditation process. CUC chose not to pursue further accreditation through any other body and, as a result, is out of compliance with the Degree Authorization Act. All of CUC's student are located in Hong Kong, will complete in August 2012, and there will be no further enrollments.

Commissioner Moses moved to revoke authorization of Colorado University of Commerce. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Rodriguez and unanimously passed.

Fiscal Year 2013 Financial Aid Allocations

Celina Duran, Financial Aid Administrator, presented the FY 2013 allocations to the Commission. The General Assembly appropriates funds from state financial aid for undergraduate need, graduate need and work study programs. The Commission is charged with allocating these funds to eligible institutions. Approximately two percent of funds from both need and work study lines were transferred to fund the Native American tuition waiver program, an entitlement program for Ft. Lewis College. The allocation methodology is based on the number of projected students at each institution.

Commissioner Garcia moved to approve the FY2013 financial aid allocation. The motion was seconded by Vice Chairman Kaufman and unanimously passed.

Designation of Nominated Representatives to the Advisory Committee Members to the CCHE – Department of Higher Education Staff

Chairman Percy presented this item. The three nominees are: Ms. Laura Rutz, Student Representative; Mr. Mark Superka, Chief Financial Officer Representative; and Dr. Keith Owen, K-12 Representative.

Commissioner Polsfut moved to nominate the three new representatives to the CCHE Advisory Committee. The motion was seconded by Vice Chairman Kaufman and unanimously passed.

INFORMATION ITEMS

Legislative Summary

Chad Marturano, Director of Legislative Affairs, discussed the legislation affecting higher education during the 2012 General Assembly impacting higher education.

The budget for the state's institutions of higher education was reduced by 27% to \$513 million from the 2009-10 level of \$706 million. Senate Bill 10-003 provides Governing Boards tuition setting authority at a rate of 9% per resident student for five years. Should the Board request tuition setting authority above 9%, they may submit a Financial Accountability Plan to the CCHE. All public four-year institutions, except the Colorado School of Mines, and the CCCS are operating under FAPs that received approval from the CCHE.

SB12-045 Higher Ed Associate Degree Transfer Students – An individual student who starts their higher education at a community college, transfers to a four year institution and accumulates 70 credit hours, now has the ability to transfer those credit hours back to a community college in order to be awarded an associate's degree.

HB12-1155 Improvements in College Completion – This bill will encourage college completion by: 1) aligning admission and remedial policies; 2) enhancing admission requirements through a collaborative process with the governing boards by taking account of the rigor of the high school courses taken and aligning the math requirement with the student's field of study; 3) allowing the use of supplemental instruction to students attending 4-year institutions as determined by CCHE.

SB12-164 Operations of Private Post-Secondary Colleges - This bill makes several changes to existing statute to clarify what kind of private institutions are subject to authorization by the CCHE; enhances student services through improved responsiveness from the Department to the students; and improves data collection. This bill died on the calendar on the second to last day of the legislative session, but was successfully amended into HB 12-1155, which was later repassed by the House of Representatives.

DISCUSSION ITEMS

Master Plan Update – Dr. Matt Gianneschi reported that Department staff held the third of three meetings with chief financial officers, chief academic officers, and chief student services officers from the state's public colleges and universities on May 23rd. The first meeting's goals were to try to establish state level metrics that would reflect the master plan's four goals. The second meeting looked at how other states had applied similar metrics to their master plans and the third meeting took feedback on what was heard and discussed at the first two meetings and how to apply it to the Colorado circumstances that both reflected the interests of the Commissioners and how to put the four agreed upon goals into specific quantifiable metrics.

The proposed metrics were divided into three categories; all institutions, community colleges and four year institutions. The metrics discussed were as follows:

All Institutions

1. Increase undergraduate credentials awarded per 100 students enrolled by 1% per year or maintain excellence (top 25% of peers).
2. Increase undergraduate STEM credentials awarded per 100 students enrolled in STEM disciplines by 1% per year or maintain excellence (top 25% of peers).

3. Annually reduce the disparity in the completion rates of college-level English and college-level mathematics courses between students originally assigned to remediation and those not assigned to remediation.
4. Annually reduce disparities in the completion rates of college-level English and college-level mathematics courses between resident minority & low-income students and resident non-minority & non-low income students.
5. Annually reduce disparities in the attainment of postsecondary credentials between resident minority and resident non-minority students per 100.
6. Lower resident students' share of college costs when state revenues are increased above inflation.
7. Maintain the institution's ratio of credentials produced relative to \$100,000 in total revenues.

Community Colleges

1. Reduce satisfactory academic progress to 12, 24, 60 credit hours (hours completed/hours attempted)
2. Increase transfer out after 12 credit hours completed
3. Increase the number of resident minority and low-income students who successfully complete the remedial course sequence.

Four-year Institutions

1. Reduce satisfactory academic progress to 12, 24, 60 credit hours (hours completed/hours attempted)
2. Ensure that credit hours to degree for resident transfer graduates are within 105% of credit hours to degree for resident native students.
3. Annually increase the yield of resident minority & low income students (enrolled/admitted) by to the meet or exceed the yield for resident non-minority & non-low income students.

In response to the feedback from participants, the Revised Performance Metrics were presented to the Commissioners:

All Institutions

1. Increase undergraduate credentials awarded by (institutional share of 1,000 new completers) per year.
2. Increase undergraduate STEM credentials awarded by (institutional share of annual goal) per year.

3. Annually reduce the disparity in the completion rates of entry-level English and entry-level mathematics courses between students originally assigned to remediation and those not assigned to remediation.
4. Annually reduce disparities in the completion rates of entry-level English and entry-level mathematics courses between resident underserved students and resident non-underserved students.
5. Annually reduce disparities in the attainment of postsecondary credentials between resident underserved and resident non-underserved students per 100 FTE of each population.
6. Lower the share of total operating revenues from resident tuition when state revenues for general operations are increased above inflation.
7. Maintain the institution's ranking relative to peers regarding the ratio of credentials produced relative to \$100,000 in total operating revenues

Community Colleges

1. Increase the proportion of degree-seeking part-time students who earn 12 in each year and the proportion of degree-seeking full-time students who earn 24 credit hours each year
2. Increase transfer out rate of degree-seeking associate of art or associate of science students who earn at least 12 credit hours
3. Increase the number of resident underserved students who successfully complete the remedial course sequence.

Four-year Institutions

1. Increase the proportion of degree-seeking part-time student who earn 12 in each year and the proportion of degree-seeking full-time students who earn 24 credit hours each year.
2. Ensure that credit hours to degree for resident transfer graduates are within 110% of credit hours to degree for resident native (non-transfer) students.
3. Annually increase the proportion of newly enrolled resident students who are from underserved populations.

CCHE has consistently expressed a sincere request in holding itself accountable to new performance objectives and ensuring that the state's performance goals are used to inform various CCHE actions. Consequently, Department staff suggest the following performance objectives for the Commission on Higher Education and the Department of Higher Education.

Suggested Performance Metrics for the Commission on Higher Education/Department of Higher Education

1. Annually request operating revenues to meet projected enrollment and inflationary increases, based upon the College Opportunity Fund stipend value established in 2005.
2. Annually request appropriations for state financial aid to meet projected changes in enrollments of resident need-eligible residents and changes in costs of attendance for resident full-time students.
3. By December 1, 2013, prepare a method to allocate performance-based operating revenue to public institutions of higher education. By September 1, 2013, prepare and disseminate to institutions and governing boards a draft of the proposed performance funding plan.
4. By December 1, 2012 and each year thereafter, review and, if necessary, modify the allocation method applied to state need-based financial aid to ensure that the allocation of such funds reinforces and supports the achievement of the state's performance goals.
5. By December 1, 2013 and each year thereafter, evaluate the current and projected student and workforce demand for postsecondary education, by type and level, and the roles and missions, locations, and service areas of existing public colleges and universities, and prepare recommendations concerning the ways in which the public system of postsecondary education could address known or projected education shortages.
6. For each year that performance contracts are in place, prepare an annual report on institutional performance regarding the goals and metrics found in the Colorado Commission on Higher Education's master plan and related performance contracts. Ensure that this report demonstrates the impacts that changes in public revenues have had on institutions' capabilities to meet performance targets.
7. Through a range of mediums and venues, improve the public's awareness of the conditions of higher education in the state by illustrating institutions' performance, demonstrating the impacts of changes in public revenues to higher education, identifying areas of opportunity to improve performance, and projecting the financial and academic needs of future students.
8. Complete revisions to the statewide remedial education policy by July 1, 2014 and implement supplemental instruction procedures by December 31, 2012.
9. Complete revisions to the statewide admission policy by July 1, 2014.

The CCHE and Department of Higher Education staff will be hosting a Trustees Summit to discuss the master plan and the performance metrics. The Trustees will have 60 days to review and respond to the proposed master plan goals and metrics prior to the adoption of the state master plan on September 1, 2012.

Commissioner Moses moved to adjourn. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Pacey. The meeting was adjourned at 4:15 pm.