

## COLORADO COMMISSION ON HIGHER EDUCATION

January 11, 2002  
Colorado History Museum  
Denver, Colorado

### MINUTES

#### Commissioners

Present: Judith Altenberg, Raymond T. Baker; Terrance L. Farina; David E. Greenberg; Peggy Lamm, Chair; "Pres" Montoya; Ralph J. Nagel; Dean L. Quamme, Vice Chair; James Stewart; William B. Vollbracht; and Judy Weaver.

#### Advisory Committee

Present: Wayne Artis; Robert A. Hessler; Kevin Kasel; Representative Keith King; Senator Ron Tupa; and Senator Sue Windels.

#### Commission Staff

Present: Timothy E. Foster, Executive Director; Andy Breckel; Michelle Derbenwick; JoAnn Evans; Ray Kieft; Bridget Mullen; and Sharon Samson.

### I. Call to Order

Chair Peggy Lamm called the regular meeting of the Colorado Commission on Higher Education to order at 1:15 p.m. in Boettcher Auditorium at the Colorado History Museum in Denver, Colorado.

**Action:** Commissioner Quamme moved approval of the minutes of the November 9, 2001, regular meeting. Commissioner Baker seconded the motion, and the motion carried unanimously.

### II. Reports

#### A. Chair's Report

Commissioner Lamm, Chair of the Commission reported that the Commission and the Governor's Blue Ribbon Panel on Higher Education for the 21<sup>st</sup> Century have spent a great deal of time during the past month discussing the role and mission statements of the intuitions. She complimented and thanked the CCHE and the institutional staff for the great deal of work it took to gather all the information and statistics for the discussion.

On behalf of the entire Commission, Chair Lamm recognized and commended Commissioner Nagel for his strong leadership as chair of the Commission for the

past year. She presented him with a gavel honoring his service as Chair of the Commission.

B. Commissioners' Reports

Commissioner Baker reported on the Capital Asset Subcommittee and thanked the staff for the preparation as it related to the Capital Development projects. (See agenda item VI, C-Report on Capital Construction). The subcommittee recently met with the Capital Development Committee and discussed the limitations of revenue. The subcommittee quantified the list of projects and was not asked to expand that list.

C. Advisory Committee Reports

No reports.

D. Public Comment

George Walker reported that he is disappointed that the Blue Ribbon Panel has not come out with something addressing the lack of funding for higher education. Colorado is 47<sup>th</sup> in the nation in funding and this is one of higher education's problems.

Chair Lamm asked Mr. Walker to be patient with the Commission and the Blue Ribbon Panel because their report will be completed in February 2002.

III. Consent Items

A. Proposals for New Academic Degree Programs

(1) Master of Arts (M.A.) in Applied Geography at the University of Colorado at Colorado Springs

The Regents of the University of Colorado requested approval of a Master of Arts (M.A.) in Applied Geography to be offered at the University of Colorado at Colorado Springs. The degree program, to be housed in the Department of Geography and Environmental Studies, will provide graduate level education to address community needs through applied geographic knowledge and research, and will include integrative skills that link human activity to natural systems.

**Staff Recommendation**

That the Commission approve the request of the Regents of the University of Colorado to offer a Master of Arts degree in Applied Geography at the University of Colorado at Colorado Springs.

(2) Proposal for a Bachelor of Arts (B.A.) in Human Development at Metropolitan State College of Denver

The Trustees of the State Colleges in Colorado requested Commission approval of a Bachelor of Arts (B.A.) degree in Human Development at Metropolitan State College of Denver (MSCD). The degree program will provide students with the opportunity to focus on the entire human life span and gain in-depth knowledge about theory, research, and application in human development.

**Staff Recommendation**

That the Commission approve the request of the Trustees of the State Colleges in Colorado for a Bachelor of Arts degree in Human Development at Metropolitan State College of Denver.

This degree approval does not imply or confer teacher education authorization. These requests will be handled through the separate teacher education approval process, coordinated with the State Board of Education. SBE indicated that they plan to take action in February and forwarded their recommendation to CCHE at that time.

B. Teacher Authorization: Modern Languages: Spanish Concentration, Elementary Teacher Education, Metropolitan State College of Denver

Metropolitan State College of Denver (MSCD) requested teacher education authorization for the Spanish major offered as part of its Modern Languages degree program. MSCD has revised the curriculum to align with the elementary content standards and requests approval for elementary education licensure with bilingual secondary endorsement. CDE reviewed the professional knowledge curriculum and recommended approval. CCHE staff has reviewed the content and field experience and recommended teacher education authorization for Metropolitan State College of Denver in Elementary Education Modern Languages: Spanish Concentration.

**Staff Recommendation**

That the Commission approves teacher education authorization in elementary education for Metropolitan State College of Denver's Modern Languages: Spanish Concentration degree program.

**Action:** Commissioner Stewart moved approval of the staff recommendations for Consent Items III A (1), III A (2), and III B. Commissioner Nagel seconded the motion and the motion carried unanimously.

IV. Action Items

A. Quality Indicator System Report FY 2000-01

Dr. Ray Kieft outlined the background and history of the Quality Indicator System (QIS). In 1996 the General Assembly passed legislation establishing the QIS and Colorado is now in the fourth year of QIS reporting. The purposes of the Quality Indicator System are to encourage continuous improvement and provide accountability for the institutions. The QIS is linked to performance funding and is used to determine the general fund distribution formula. The QIS focuses on full-time, degree-seeking undergraduate students, and the results of QIS are of past experience rather than current activities. The format of collecting data for the QIS coincides with federal guidelines; therefore, the data can be compared to other states.

Dr. Kieft clarified that the Colorado School of Mines and the University of Colorado Health Sciences Center (UCHSC) included in the QIS report. Legislation was passed last year which established Mines outside of the QIS process. Mines has a separate performance agreement with the Commission and the UCHSC is very specialized.

Student success indicators of freshman retention, persistence and graduation rates dominate the results of the QIS. One thing added to the report this year is the transfer student. If a student begins their freshman year at Institution A and transfers to Institution B, Institution A should get some recognition for the fact that it contributed to the student's success. Retention is measured at both institutions.

Dr. Kieft outlined all the aspects of the QIS Report and stated that the statute requires each governing board presents a response to the Quality Indicator System every year. They will do that by the end of January 2002, and the governing board reports will be forwarded to the General Assembly along with the QIS Report.

The QIS data shows that both the freshman persistence rate and the freshman retention rate within Colorado have improved over the past three years. Nine of the eleven four-year institutions exceed the national benchmark in terms of their four-year graduation rate. This indicates that Colorado's institutions are performing at or above their national comparison group in terms of like measures of graduation, retention, and persistence.

The higher the performance level as compared to the benchmark of an institution, the better their performance overall score is, and that gets translated into a higher percentage recommendation for the allocation of general fund.

The Commissioners discussed the possibility of raising the benchmark to the top quartile of peer institutions; however, no decision was made at this time.

**Staff Recommendation**

That the Commission approve the Quality Indicator System Report.

**Action:** Commissioner Nagel moved approval of the staff recommendation. Commissioner Greenberg seconded the motion and the motion carried unanimously.

V. Discussion and Possible Action

A. 2001 Report on Newly Approved Degree Programs

Dr. Sharon Samson reported that the Annual Report on Newly Approved Degree Programs monitors the implementation of the new academic programs. It compares the projected enrollment and graduation numbers originally provided by the proposing institution with the actual enrollment and graduation data of the degree program. Newly approved degree programs are monitored for the first five years and when a degree program meets its projections, its approval status moves from provisional to full approval. The monitor process allows the Commission to make sure that it is using resources well.

This year there are four programs that are at the end of their five-year review cycle:

- Cell and Molecular Biology (M.S.)                      Colorado State University
- Cell and Molecular Biology (Ph.D.)                      Colorado State University
- Theatre Arts (B.A.)    Fort Lewis College
- Engineering (M.E.)    University of Colorado at Denver

Staff recommends that the Commission grant full approval status to CSU's Cell and Molecular Biology Ph.D. degree, FLC's Theatre Arts B.A. degree, and UCD's M.E. in Engineering. If the Commission adopts the recommendation, the degree programs will no longer be included in the annual Report on Newly Approved Degree Programs, but will be included in CCHE's Annual Low Demand Program Report.

In keeping with CCHE's protocol, the Commission formally notifies the governing boards through the agenda item of those degree programs approaching the five-year review point. The Commission expects governing boards to take appropriate action, if necessary, before the Commission 2003 Review of Newly Approved Degree Programs. The following seven programs will be in the final year of the follow-up next year:

- University of Colorado at Boulder – East Asian Language M.A.
- University of Colorado at Boulder – Kinesiology Ph.D.
- University of Colorado at Colorado Springs – Computer Science Ph.D.
- University of Colorado at Colorado Springs – Electrical Engineering Ph.D.
- University of Colorado at Denver – Design & Planning Ph.D.
- University of Colorado at Health Sciences Center – Clinical Science Ph.D.
- Western State College – Art B.F.A.

Several of these graduate programs have not achieved their projected enrollment or graduation numbers in the past four years, including UCCS Computer Science Ph.D., UCD Design & Planning Ph.D., and UCHSC Clinical Science Ph.D. It also has concerns with the declining enrollment in Electrical Engineering Ph.D. offered by UCCS. It has no concerns with UCB's East Asian Language MA program, Kinesiology Ph.D. or the BFA in Art offered by WSC.

Dr. Betsy Hoffman, President of the University of Colorado, reported that her office and the Board of Regents are carefully monitoring the low enrollment programs and will take appropriate steps, if necessary.

Representative King raised a concern about the low enrollment in the computer engineering program at UCCS. Dr. Samson explained that at the bachelor's level it is often typical for a new program to experience light enrollment the first year. President Hoffman reported that the institution is working with companies in the Colorado Springs area to promote enrollment in the program.

Commissioner Greenberg pointed out that over his tenure on the Commission there's been an evolution toward more scrutiny of the program approval process in terms of institutional accountability.

### **Staff Recommendation**

That the Commission approve full degree approval for the following degree programs:

- Colorado State University Cell and Molecular Biology (Ph.D.)
- Fort Lewis College Theatre Arts (B.A.)
- University of Colorado at Denver Engineering (M.E.)

**Action:** Commissioner Altenberg moved approval of the staff recommendation. Commissioner Farina seconded the motion and the motion carried unanimously.

### B. Annual Report on Discontinuance of Academic Degrees with Low Program Demand

Dr. Sharon Samson reported that the policy on low demand programs is a unique policy in Colorado. Low-demand degree programs are those programs that failed to meet the minimum graduation benchmarks as defined in state policy. The low-demand review does not include degree programs that the Commission has approved in the last five years. The Commission took the lead in setting the policy, and the governing boards adopted similar policies internally and now they are the leaders and CCHE is the follower. As governing boards implement new programs, they discontinue low-demand as part of their management process.

In 2002, the low demand review identified 19 degree programs that are operating below the benchmarks, including:

- Undergraduate degree programs that fail to graduate at least 10 students in the current year or a total of 20 students in the past three years. Each institution may exempt up to five undergraduate degree programs that are central to the institution's role and mission.
- Masters' degree programs that fail to graduate at least three students in the current year or a total of five in the past three years.
- Doctoral programs that fail to graduate at least one student in the current year or a total of three in the past three years.

As a matter of public notice staff recommended that the Commission notify the respective governing boards of the need to take action on the following low-demand degree programs by April 2002:

ASC	Geology Mathematics
CSM	Chemistry (MS) Physics (MS) Geological Engineering (Ph.D) Geochemistry (Ph.D)
CSU	Botany (BS)
FLC	Music (BA) Theatre (BA)
MESA	Selected Studies (BA)
METRO	Music/Music Performance (BA/BFA)
UCB	Distributed Studies (BA) Comparative Literature (MA)
UCCS	Allied Health (action by 2003)
UCD	School Psychology (MA)
UNC	Physics (BA) School Psychology (MA)
USC	Electronics Engineering Tech (BS) (action by 2003) Foreign Language (action by 2003)
WSC	Mathematics (BS) Chemistry (BS) Physics (BS)

### C. Teacher Education Report

Michelle Derbenwick stated that Colorado statute (22-60.5-116.5) requires that the Commission report annually to the house and senate education committees on the performance, quality, and effectiveness of the redesigned teacher education programs. This first annual report, due January 2002, updates the education committees on the implementation of the SB 99-154, including:

- Overview of the number of approved teacher education programs and the quality criteria for approving the degrees.
- Design of the teacher education performance model and next steps to improve the reliability and validity of the primary performance indicators, including potentially using another content test in lieu of the PLACE content area assessment and developing the first-and-third year survey to align with the statutory performance measures.
- Baseline information from the first year of Teacher Education SURDS data collection (teacher pipeline, low enrollment programs, and institutions with students in unapproved programs).

Ms. Derbenwick outlined the components of the performance model for teacher preparation programs. The model will address (1) Where teacher candidates are and what are they pursuing? (2) How are teacher candidates performing in the programs while they're still in school?, and (3) How do those candidates perform once they graduate and enter the K-12 classroom?

One of the ultimate goals of staff is to have a valid and reliable assessment of the content area knowledge before teachers enter their student teaching portion of their preparation. CCHE is currently evaluating the PLACE test developed by National Evaluation Systems (NES) for its validity and reliability. A second goal is to have a valid and reliable means of assessing teacher skills (Pedagogy). This is in the pilot stage with the Colorado Department of Education currently evaluating the collection of the work sample. The final goal is the survey of teachers and administrators in the field. CCHE is looking at a valid and reliable survey to assess the first- and third-year teacher perceptions of the strengths and weaknesses of their programs.

Ms. Derbenwick presented the highlights from the data collected in 2001 Teacher Education Report. She also discussed the potential issues with the content area assessment as it is now. The issues are as follows:

- Test administered only three times per year.
- Inhibits higher education institutions from implementing the performance model that stipulates a passing score on the content area assessment prior to student teaching.
- Little study material is available for student preparation for exam.
- Reciprocity with other states is limited because PLACE is only recognized in Colorado.
- Validity for low demand exams, e.g. agriculture, is difficult to achieve.
- National Evaluation Systems (NES) is not affiliated with any accrediting organizations while other testing organizations are affiliated.

CCHE piloted a telephone survey in the summer of 2001 in order to obtain a higher response rate than the written pilot on the first- and third-year teacher survey. The telephone survey doubled the response rate and provided valuable information that can be implemented in the redesign of the survey.

Commissioner Weaver is very supportive of higher education's efforts to raise the bar for teacher preparation schools. She pointed out that it's not just about preparing teachers in content areas. It's about how effectively they take that education and training and translate it in the classroom so that students are excelling and achieving in order to go on to higher education. The Pueblo school district has been successful using the Sanders value-added model to tie student achievement to teacher performance.

CCHE staff have been investigating the use of the Sanders model. The Sanders model is very cautious about having three consecutive years of teacher data before judgments are made. CSAP is not administered to all grades every year.

The Commission discussed the cost to the student of PLACE exam as well as the validity of the exam. Executive Director Foster stated that Colorado higher education will stand behind the quality of the teacher preparation, which is validated by data. CCHE has requested data to better analyze the PLACE exam. That data will be available in March 2002.

Dr. Nancy Hartley, Dean of the College of Applied Human Sciences at Colorado State University and co-chair of the Colorado Council of Deans of Education, spoke on behalf of the Deans of Education who would like to see more details about the Praxis II exam. She stated that from a preliminary glance of the exam, it appears it could be a possibility for Colorado. The deans would like to work very closely with CCHE in looking at the details of that test. She pointed out that the education deans think it would be unfair to students to move into a second test until the issue with the PLACE exam is resolved.

D. Governor's Opportunity Scholarship Report and Presentation

Ms. Bridget Mullen reported that Colorado's low-income students continue to confront significant financial barriers that limit their ability to access and stay in college. As a result, the college entry and completion rates of low-income students in Colorado continues to lag well behind their middle-income and upper-income peers. Nationally, the college participation rate of students from families earning below \$25,000 lags 32 percentage points behind those families earning above \$75,000. The difference is even greater in Colorado.

In order to address the current opportunity gap and avoid a potential access crisis in the future, the Governor and the Commission, with the support of the General Assembly and the state's institutions of higher education, are addressing the access issue by focusing their commitment to low-income families by providing financial assistance to Colorado students who otherwise would not be able to attend college. Providing access to Colorado residents is one of the main goals of the Commission as outlined in the recently approved Master Plan.

To qualify for the Governor's Opportunity Scholarship (GOS) the recipient's family contribution is zero or an average gross income of less than \$26,000. The

recipient must be a first-time, full-time degree seeking student. The recipient must participate in the academic and student services programs offered by the institution, and at a minimum, with respect to their financial aid package, receive a federal PELL grant, and agree not to take out a student loan.

In 2002, \$6 million was appropriated to fund GOS scholarships and there are more than 1,000 students that have received scholarship awards to date.

College participation rates are a strong indicator of a state's economic vitality. Colorado ranks first among all states with the percentage of its population with baccalaureate degrees. Only 17 percent of Colorado's low income students are going to college. Colorado is 50<sup>th</sup> with respect to the percent of low income students attending college.

The GOS program began in fall 1999 and it is too early to determine how the program is doing. Success will be determined by the number of GOS recipients that graduate.

## VI. Written Reports for Possible Discussion

### A. Diversity Report

Ms. Michelle Derbenwick reported that under the Diversity Policy, the Commission annually monitors the state's progress toward access to higher education for all its citizens and the governing boards' progress in achieving institutional access and diversity goals. The Diversity Report describes the participation, retention, and graduation rates of students of various ethnicities in state-supported institutions of higher education with a historical viewpoint. Because providing broad and representative access to a quality undergraduate learning experience is the primary goal of the Diversity Policy, the undergraduate participation indicators are the leading indicators of policy success.

By policy, Colorado defines underrepresented higher education populations as those students with Hispanic, Asian, Black or Native American descent. Examining the enrollment, retention, and graduation rates of these students within Colorado's higher education system, the 2001 Diversity Report identified the trends or conditions. The analysis looks at the high school graduate ethnic composition; the trends in in-state enrollment, student retention and graduation rates, and in awards granted to in-state students. Retention in the four-year institutions has increased for under-represented groups.

Commissioner Stewart pointed out that the Hispanic population in Colorado has been on the rise yet are under-represented in terms of the number of Hispanic students that attend college. The Commission needs to address this issue.

### B. Report on Out-of-State Instruction

The Commission accepted the report on out-of-state instruction as follows:

The Board of Regents of the University of Colorado has submitted a request for an out-of-state instructional program, which was delivered by the University of Colorado Health Sciences Center.

Keystone Symposia on Molecular & Cellular Biology- 2002 Series, a series of six out-of-state instructional programs to be presented in Banff, Alberta, Canada (2 programs); Taos, New Mexico (2 programs); Santa Fe, New Mexico (1 program); and Tahoe City, California (1 program) during the time from February 8 to March 17, 2002.

C. Report on Capital Construction, Lease Approvals, Cash Funded Capital Projects and SB 209 Report

The Commission accepted the report on capital construction, lease approvals, cash funded capital projects and SB 209 Report.

D. FTE Service Area Exemptions: Approval for State Supported Instruction Outside Community College Service Area Boundaries

The Commission accepted the report on FTE Service Area Exemptions:

Approval for State-Supported Instruction Outside Community College Service Area Boundaries.

E. Concept Paper

1. Ph.D. in Computer Science and Information Systems at the University of Colorado at Denver

The Regents of the University of Colorado, in conjunction with the Colorado Institute of Technology, submitted a concept paper for a Ph.D. in Computer Science and Information Systems to be offered by the University of Colorado at Denver. The Commission accepted the concept paper as submitted.

F. Capital Assets Subcommittee Report

The Commission accepted the Capital Assets Subcommittee Report as presented.

**Action:** Commissioner Greenberg moved to adjourn. The motion carried unanimously and the meeting adjourned at 3:38 p.m.