

# STATUS OF PERFORMANCE CONTRACT COMPLIANCE: PRIVATE COLLEGES AND UNIVERSITIES

SUPPLEMENTAL REPORT TO THE EDUCATION COMMITTEES OF THE SENATE AND HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES AND THE JOINT BUDGET COMMITTEE OF THE COLORADO GENERAL ASSEMBLY IN RESPONSE TO SB 04-189

**JULY 2012** 

This supplemental report covers the status of Colorado's participating private institutions' compliance with requirements stated in their performance contracts. Information in this report was provided to the Colorado Department of Higher Education under requirements of the College Opportunity Fund legislation, SB 04-189.

## Prepared by:

Division of Academic Affairs Colorado Department of Higher Education 1560 Broadway Suite 1600 Denver, CO 80202 (303) 866-2723

#### Overview

The Department of Higher Education (DHE) is charged, in section 23-5-129(5)(b) C.R.S., to report annually to the Education Committees of the Senate and House of Representatives and the Joint Budget Committee of the Colorado General Assembly on the progress made towards the goals set forth in each public and participating private institution's performance contract.

In light of the fact that a final evaluation on performance contract compliance for the public institutions entitled, *Final Performance Contract Review Report per CCHE Workplan*, was prepared for and submitted to the Commission at its February 4, 2011 meeting—several months before existing performance contracts were extended by way of SB 11-052—department staff have been planning ways for institutions to ensure ongoing compliance with existing performance contracts while reducing the need to produce reports concerning performance criteria that were originally designed for achievement in 2008 as well as recognizing that new performance criteria and performance contracts will be adopted by the Commission within the next six months.

At its December 2, 2011 meeting, the Commission approved an alternative reporting process and gave public institutions an extension to January 31, 2012 to allow each governing board to certify that its institution or institutions continue to meet the performance goals found in their contracts. To ensure compliance with current performance contracts, the department ran SURDS data for "Goal 1: Access and Success" for each public and participating private institution and reviewed the data for ongoing compliance with each institution's "Access and Success" metrics. To ensure compliance with Goals 2, 3, 4 & 5 of the contracts, which applies to the public institutions and systems only, the department created a template (see Appendix A) for "Certification of Compliance" that each public governing board and president signed to certify that they are meeting their metrics for each of these goals and, in cases where they were not meeting those metrics, they were to provide a brief description of how they plan to do so.

The three private institutions that have performance contracts with the department are Colorado Christian University, Regis University and University of Denver. The quality assurance reporting that is developed with these private institutions differs from that with the public institutions and focuses specifically on the graduation, retention, and success rates of participating Pell-eligible students.

It should also be noted that since the three private institutions have relatively small populations of Pell-eligible students. As a result, rate calculations viewed on a year-over-year basis can be unstable. A future consideration for performance contracts is to use "number of individuals retained" rather than "retention rate," or some other metric, because rates that are based on small population sizes can be misleading and leave themselves open to misinterpretation.

The remainder of this report details the extent to which the goals in the performance contracts have been met. The focus now is on the adoption of new performance criteria and performance contracts to meet the December 1, 2012 deadline.

## **Private Institutions: Compliance With and Success on Performance Goals**

The performance contracts with Colorado Christian University, University of Denver and Regis University contain three goals:

- 1. <u>Access:</u> Increase by three percentage points the enrollment of underserved students, including low-income (PELL eligible) individuals, males, and minorities;
- 2. <u>Retention:</u> Ensure that the retention rate for low-income, male and minority students meets or exceeds the institution's overall retention rate; and
- 3. Other State Needs: The goal is to transmit to the department annually educator preparation, student enrollment, and student completer data.

### Goal #1: Access

The access goal was to increase the enrollment of low-income (PELL eligible) students by three percentage points.

Colorado Christian University met this goal with a nineteen percentage point (19%) increase in Pell-eligible students from fall 2008 to fall 2010.

The University of Denver met this goal with a seven percentage point (7%) increase in Pelleligible students from 2007 to 2010.

Regis University met this goal with an almost ten percentage point ( $\geq 10\%$ ) increase in Pelleligible students from 2008 to 2010.

## **Goal #2: Retention**

The three private institutions' retention goal was to meet or exceed retention for first-time full-time students (excluding transfer students) for:

- a. Low-income (Pell-eligible) students;
- b. Low-income, male students; and
- c. Low-income, minority students.

Colorado Christian University's deadline to reach this goal is by June 30, 2014. University of Denver's and Regis University's deadline was June 30, 2010. Retention rates for each of these groups are reported by school below.

#### 2.a. All Low-Income (PELL eligible) Students

The retention rates for low-income students at Colorado Christian University lagged the overall retention rate by more than twelve points in 2008, by almost six points in 2009, and by six points in 2010.

University of Denver met this goal. Their retention of low-income students has exceeded the overall retention rate for years 2007-2010.

Table 3 below shows that Regis University met this goal in 2010.

#### 2.b.Low-Income, Males

The retention rates for low-income male students at Colorado Christian University lagged the overall retention rate by five points in 2008, twenty-two points in 2009, and eleven points in 2010.

Table 2 below shows University of Denver met this goal. Their retention of low-income, male students has exceeded the overall retention rate for years 2007-2010.

Table 3 below shows Regis University met this goal in 2008 and 2009 but not in 2010, with retention of low-income males lagging four points behind overall retention.

### 2.c. Low-Income, Minority Students

Colorado Christian University continues to make progress on closing gap in retention rates for low-income minority students. The rate gap was thirteen points in 2008, three points in 2009, and nearly three points in 2010.

Table 2 below shows University of Denver met this goal. The retention of low-income, male students at DU exceeded the overall retention rate for years 2008-2010.

Table 3 below shows Regis University met this goal in 2010.

#### **Goal #3: Other State Needs (Educator Preparation)**

All three private institutions continue to meet this goal and their data is included in the commission's annual *Educator Preparation Report to the General Assembly*.

TABLE 1: COLORADO CHRISTIAN UNIVERSITY ENROLLMENT AND RETENTION DATA, 2008-2010  $^{1}$ 

	Enrollment				Retention Cohort					tained foll	_		% Retained following fall at institution, of Cohort				
	Fall	Fall	Fall	Fall	Fall	Fall	Fall	Fall	Fall	Fall	Fall	Fall	Fall	Fall	Fall	Fall	
Institution	2007	2008	2009	2010	2007	2008	2009	2010	2007	2008	2009	2010	2007	2008	2009	2010	
All Students		2768	2677	2897		632	248	264		390	160	187		61.7%	64.5%	70.8%	
Registration Status																	
First-Time		945	329	321		N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A	N/A	N/A	
Transfer		1484	1372	1312		N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A	N/A	N/A	
Continuing		339	976	1264		N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A	N/A	N/A	
Male		1,833	821	807		254	94	88		163	52	62		64.2%	55.3%	70.5%	
Minority		324	140	155		31	13	7		15	6	4		48.4%	46.2%	57.1%	
White		1,509	681	652		189	81	81		122	46	58		64.6%	56.8%	71.6%	
Female		2,949	1,381	1,491		378	154	176		227	108	125		60.1%	70.1%	71.0%	
Minority		490	252	288		35	18	13		17	12	7		48.6%	66.7%	53.8%	
White		2,459	1,129	1,203		300	136	163		178	96	118		59.3%	70.6%	72.4%	
Male Total		1,833	821	807		254	94	88		163	52	62		64.2%	55.3%	70.5%	
Female Total		2,949	1,381	1,491		378	154	176		227	108	125		60.1%	70.1%	71.0%	
Minority Total		814	392	443		66	31	20		32	18	11		48.5%	58.1%	55.0%	
White Total		3,968	1,810	1,855		489	217	244		300	142	176		61.3%	65.4%	72.1%	
Pell Eligible -Male		302	311	357		154	38	37		87	16	22		56.5%	42.1%	59.5%	
Minority		62	65	78		27	8	5		14	3	2		51.9%	37.5%	40.0%	
White		240	246	279		168	30	32		77	13	20		45.8%	43.3%	62.5%	
Pell Eligible -Female		532	559	764		221	59	70		109	41	47		49.3%	69.5%	67.1%	
Minority		103	125	174		24	9	8		11	5	3		45.8%	55.6%	37.5%	
White		429	434	590		109	50	62		59	36	44		54.1%	72.0%	71.0%	
Pell Eligible -Male Total		302	311	357		154	38	37		87	16	22		56.5%	42.1%	59.5%	
Pell Eligible -Female Total		532	559	764		221	59	70		109	41	47		49.3%	69.5%	67.1%	
Pell Eligible -Minority Total		165	190	252		51	17	13		25	8	5		49.0%	47.1%	38.5%	
Pell Eligible -White Total		669	680	869		277	80	94		136	49	64		49.1%	61.3%	68.1%	
Total Pell Eligible (Minority & White)		834	870	1,121		328	97	107		161	57	69		49.1%	58.8%	64.5%	

TABLE 2: UNIVERSITY OF DENVER ENROLLMENT AND RETENTION DATA,  $2007\text{-}2010^1$ 

	Enrollment				ĺ	Retentio	n Cohort			ined foll	_		% Retained following fall at institution, of Cohort				
	Fall	Fall	Fall	Fall	Fall	Fall	Fall	Fall	Fall	Fall	Fall	Fall	Fall	Fall	Fall	Fall	
Institution	2007	2008	2009	2010	2007	2008	2009	2010	2007	2008	2009	2010	2007	2008	2009	2010	
All Students	11053	11328	11707	11842	1142	1096	1160	1159	977	910	993	995	85.6%	83.0%	85.6%	85.8%	
Registration Status																	
First-Time	3,287	3,140	3,531	7,127	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	
Transfer	296	278	268	232	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	
Continuing	7,470	7,910	7,908	4,483	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	
Male	4,284	4,304	4,332	4,597	517	486	495	528	455	404	426	442	88.0%	83.1%	86.1%	83.7%	
Minority	594	662	669	916	63	67	71	108	56	55	60	95	88.9%	82.1%	84.5%	88.0%	
White	3,690	3,642	3,663	3,681	454	419	424	420	399	349	366	347	87.9%	83.3%	86.3%	82.6%	
Female	5,602	5,674	5,726	6,150	625	610	665	631	522	506	567	553	83.5%	83.0%	85.3%	87.6%	
Minority	1,030	1,138	1,211	1,628	113	103	149	166	92	84	125	144	81.4%	81.6%	83.9%	86.7%	
White	4,572	4,536	4,515	4,522	512	507	516	465	430	422	442	409	84.0%	83.2%	85.7%	88.0%	
Male Total	4,284	4,304	4,332	4,597	517	486	495	528	455	404	426	442	88.0%	83.1%	86.1%	83.7%	
Female Total	5,602	5,674	5,726	6,150	625	610	665	631	522	506	567	553	83.5%	83.0%	85.3%	87.6%	
Minority Total	1,624	1,800	1,880	2,544	176	170	220	274	148	139	185	239	84.1%	81.8%	84.1%	87.2%	
White Total	8,262	8,178	8,178	8,203	966	926	940	885	829	771	808	756	85.8%	83.3%	86.0%	85.4%	
Pell Eligible -Male	1,486	1,461	1,660	1,971	170	171	176	198	149	145	158	171	87.6%	84.8%	89.8%	86.4%	
Minority	240	241	287	448	25	25	29	64	22	20	27	57	88.0%	80.0%	93.1%	89.1%	
White	1,246	1,220	1,373	1,523	145	146	147	134	127	125	131	114	87.6%	85.6%	89.1%	85.1%	
Pell Eligible -Female	2,251	2,209	2,447	2,886	256	236	269	250	217	203	231	225	84.8%	86.0%	85.9%	90.0%	
Minority	484	524	578	848	51	52	71	87	41	45	62	80	80.4%	86.5%	87.3%	92.0%	
White	1,767	1,685	1,869	2,038	205	184	198	163	176	158	169	145	85.9%	85.9%	85.4%	89.0%	
Pell Eligible -Male Total	1,486	1,461	1,660	1,971	170	171	176	198	149	145	158	171	87.6%	84.8%	89.8%	86.4%	
Pell Eligible -Female Total	2,251	2,209	2,447	2,886	256	236	269	250	217	203	231	225	84.8%	86.0%	85.9%	90.0%	
Pell Eligible -Minority Total	724	765	865	1,296	76	77	100	151	63	65	89	137	82.9%	84.4%	89.0%	90.7%	
Pell Eligible -White Total	3,013	2,905	3,242	3,561	350	330	345	297	303	283	300	259	86.6%	85.8%	87.0%	87.2%	
Total Pell Eligible (Minority & White)	3,737	3,670	4,107	4,857	426	407	445	448	366	348	389	396	85.9%	85.5%	87.4%	88.4%	

TABLE 3: REGIS UNIVERSITY ENROLLMENT DATA,  $2008-2010^1$ 

	Enrollment				Retention Cohort					ained foll stitution,			% Retained following fall at institution, of Cohort				
	Fall	Fall	Fall	Fall	Fall	Fall	Fall	Fall	Fall	Fall	Fall	Fall	Fall	Fall	Fall	Fall	
Institution	2007	2008	2009	2010	2007	2008	2009	2010	2007	2008	2009	2010	2007	2008	2009	2010	
All Students		11040	10874	11069		360	376	429		274	315	353		76.1%	83.8%	82.3%	
Registration Status																	
First-Time		340	325	352		N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A	N/A	N/A	
Transfer		3,283	3,133	2,992		N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A	N/A	N/A	
Continuing		7,219	7,358	7,657		N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A	N/A	N/A	
Male		3,173	3,218	3,136		134	140	164		102	113	130		76.1%	80.7%	79.3%	
Minority		690	765	781		28	36	28		23	29	20		82.1%	80.6%	71.4%	
White		2,483	2,453	2,355		89	96	98		67	80	79		89.9%	82.3%	80.6%	
Female		6,066	6,143	6,319		221	229	254		169	198	214		89.6%	93.4%	84.3%	
Minority		1,366	1,440	1,388		55	60	77		44	52	65		80.0%	86.7%	84.4%	
White		4,700	4,703	4,931		149	148	147		114	128	126		85.9%	85.1%	85.7%	
Male Total		3,173	3,218	3,136		134	140	164		102	113	130		76.1%	80.7%	79.3%	
Female Total		6,066	6,143	6,319		221	229	254		169	198	214		76.5%	86.5%	84.3%	
Minority Total		2,056	2,205	2,169		83	96	105		67	81	85		80.7%	84.4%	81.0%	
White Total		7,183	7,156	7,286		238	244	245		181	208	205		76.1%	85.2%	83.7%	
Pell Eligible -Male		610	764	921		59	63	73		47	54	57		79.7%	85.7%	78.1%	
Minority		160	237	304		11	16	11		10	12	8		90.9%	75.0%	72.7%	
White		450	527	617		43	45	39		33	40	31		76.7%	88.9%	79.5%	
Pell Eligible -Female		1,446	1,740	2,109		88	76	126		63	59	105		71.6%	77.6%	83.3%	
Minority		415	523	597		20	20	37		15	15	32		75.0%	75.0%	86.5%	
White		1,031	1,217	1,512		52	47	68		37	38	57		71.2%	80.9%	83.8%	
Pell Eligible -Male Total		610	764	921		59	63	73		47	54	57		79.7%	85.7%	78.1%	
Pell Eligible -Female Total		1,446	1,740	2,109		88	76	126		63	59	105		71.6%	77.6%	83.3%	
Pell Eligible -Minority Total		575	760	901		31	36	48		25	27	40		80.6%	75.0%	83.3%	
Pell Eligible -White Total		1,481	1,744	2,129		95	92	107		70	78	88		73.7%	84.8%	82.2%	
Total Pell Eligible (Minority & White)		2,056	2,504	3,030		126	128	155		95	105	128		75.4%	82.0%	82.6%	

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Data notes for Tables 1-3: Cohort includes fall enrollment, First-time defined as enrolled in fall, first-time status in fall or preceding summer, degree seeking, undergraduates. Pell-eligible is defined as for Year FY2011 EFC <= 5273; Year FY2010 EFC <= 4617; Year FY2009 EFC <=4041; Years FY2004-08 EFC <= 3850. Ethnicity - Minority and White counts do not include Non-Resident Alien or Unknown Ethnicity. CCU data in Fall 2008 was submitted with Institutional Student IDs, a separate collection was used to fill in Student IDs. Regis cohorts are the IPEDS full-time cohorts, submitted separately than the SURDS cohort generation