

Minutes of the Colorado Commission on Higher Education (CCHE) Meeting  
1560 Broadway, Denver, CO 80202  
February 9, 2012

Chairman Percy called the meeting to order at 1:08pm

Chairman Hereford Percy, Commissioners Larry Beckner, Dave Edwards, Jeanette Garcia, Happy Haynes, and BJ Scott were in attendance. Also in attendance were CCHE Advisory Committee members Dr. Frank Novotny, Ruth Annette Carter, Kelly Fox, and Mike Mincic.

Commissioner Edwards moved to approve the minutes of the January 6, 2011 CCHE meeting. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Garcia and passed unanimously.

### **CHAIRMAN AND COMMISSIONER REPORTS**

Commissioner Garcia attended a College in Colorado workshop on February 8<sup>th</sup>. She believes this division of the Department of Higher Education helps the Commission meet its mission of accessibility and affordability for all Coloradoans and encouraged the other Commissioners to familiarize themselves with the work that College in Colorado is doing.

Chairman Percy attended a taping of Colorado Quarterly at Rocky Mountain PBS. The panel discussion, led by RMPBS CEO Doug Price, was centered on higher education in Colorado. Dr. Nancy McCallin, President of the Colorado Community College System; Dr. Lesley DiMare, President of CSU-Pueblo; and Carl Camden, CEO of Kelly Services, an international employment service agency. Mr. Camden is also a member of a national economic development commission and the discussion was on the relationship between higher education institutions and the business community.

### **EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR REPORT**

Lt. Governor Joe Garcia, Executive Director of the Department of Higher Education, reported there was a press conference held for the release of the remedial report, which will be addressed later in the meeting. Lt. Governor Garcia also introduced TBD Colorado to the Commission. The Governor initially conceived the idea and it is now an effort being led by private citizens. TBD Colorado is an effort to travel around the state to ask Coloradans what issues are important to them, learn about their shared values, and ask what they want from various public services. There will be over 100 meetings held around the state, involving thousands of people. The Lt. Governor is providing input on the K-12 and higher education pieces of TBD Colorado.

Lt. Governor Garcia also told the Commission that the White House decided to grant waivers to the requirements of the No Child Left Behind Act to ten states, including Colorado. He believes that Colorado will be singled out as the State that is farthest ahead in assessments of individual students and their growth.

Lastly, the Lt Governor reported that he has finished his term as Chairman of the executive committee of WICHE, the Western Interstate Commission on Higher Education, and will remain on the committee.

## **PUBLIC COMMENT**

Matt Gettleman, with the Higher Education Access Alliance, and Yesinia Gonzalez, testified on upcoming legislation, Senate Bill 12-015, Concerning Creating An Optional Category Of Tuition At State Institutions Of Higher Education. Mr. Gettleman and Ms. Gonzalez asked the Commission to support the bill, which the Commissioners addressed at the end of the agenda.

## **CONSENT ITEMS**

**Approval of the 2012 Commission Meeting Schedule**

**Revised Two-Year Cash Funded Capital Program List – University Of Colorado at Boulder**

**Revised Two-Year Cash Funded Capital Program List – University Of Colorado at Colorado Springs**

**2012 – 2013 Student Budget Parameters**

**Proposal To Offer A Bachelor Of Fine Arts In Communication Design And A Bachelor Of Arts In Art History, Theory, And Criticism At Metropolitan State College Of Denver**

**Resolution Regarding The Authorization Of Colorado College, Regis University, And The University Of Denver To Operate In Colorado**

Commissioner Garcia moved to approve the consent items. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Haynes and unanimously passed.

## **ACTION ITEMS**

**FY 2012-2013 Financial Aid Allocation Recommendations** – Celina Duran, Financial Aid Director, presented this item to the Commission. In December, Governor Hickenlooper's office proposed restoring the planned reduction to state financial aid funds. Due to the late timing of the restoration proposal, the Commission suggested that significant changes to the financial aid allocation model were not advisable for FY13. The Commission plans to initiate discussions with the institutions to determine whether the current financial aid allocation method is the most effective technique for providing support to Colorado students in the 2013-14 fiscal year.

Enrollment projections in the current year indicate enrollment growth appears to be slowing down compared to the prior year. And the FY 2012-13 financial aid allocations were adjusted to compensate for the decelerating enrollment. As proposed in the item, the FY2012-13 financial aid allocations will use each institution's actual FY2010-11 Level 1 FTE for institutions experiencing enrollment growth. For institutions experiencing enrollment declines, a three-year average of Level I FTE will be applied.

Commissioner Garcia moved to approve the financial aid allocation recommendations. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Haynes and unanimously passed.

**Approval of Master Plan Goals** - Dr. Matt Gianneschi, Executive Deputy Director of the Department of Higher Education, presented this item. At the January 6, 2012 CCHE meeting, Commission members considered revisions that Department staff had made to the four goals in light of comments made at the December 2 summit meeting, as well as a new draft narrative section that serves as an introduction to the goals. At that meeting, the Commissioners also asked staff to provide a draft fifth goal concerning the value of higher education to economic development in the state. This agenda item presents the four preliminary statewide goals, as revised after the January 6 meeting, and an optional fifth goal. Below are the four goals with revisions that were made after input from the institution CEOs, along with a fifth goal:

**Goal 1: Increase Attainment:** Increase the attainment of high quality postsecondary credentials across the academic disciplines and throughout Colorado in order to meet anticipated workforce demands.

**Goal 2: Improve Student Success:** Improve student success through better outcomes in basic skills education, enhanced student support services and reduced average time to credential for all students.

**Goal 3: Diversify Enrollments and Reduce Attainment Gaps:** Enhance access to and through postsecondary education to ensure that the system reflects the changing demographics of the state while reducing attainment gaps among students from underserved communities.

**Goal 4: Restore Balance in Postsecondary Revenues and Improve Productivity:** Develop resources, from public and private sources, that will allow public institutions of higher education to successfully meet projected enrollment demands, stabilize resident students' relative share of college costs, and maintain the state's position as a national leader in the ratio of credentials produced relative to state investments in higher education.

**Goal 5: Continue to Catalyze the State's Economy:** *Strengthen higher education's impact on the state's recovering economy by expanding research and scholarly activities, enriching the state's human capital by expanding and developing new programs in high demand fields, investing in programs that directly impact state and regional economies, and increasing public-private partnerships.*

The Commissioners suggested the following changes to the first four goals:

Commissioner Beckner suggested that along with meeting anticipated workforce demands in Goal 1, there be a statement about enhancing the intellectual development of the individuals to produce well educated people. Dr. Gianneschi suggested the idea be expounded upon in the narrative which will make the Master Plan a much fuller document. Lt. Governor Garcia stated that throughout the body of the document, the emphasis will be on the importance of having an engaged, informed and well educated citizenry in order to make Colorado strong, not just in terms of the work force, but to create the kind of cultural, political, as well as academic vitality, we need as a state.

Commissioners Scott and Haynes suggested adding language after basic skills education that speaks to the notion of college readiness in Goal 2. CCHE Advisor Carter suggested that the word “basic” be eliminated.

Commissioner Scott suggested that Goal 3 be fleshed out, in the narrative following the goal, where some of the original focus might be in the beginning in trying to attain this goal.

In Goal 4, both Commissioner Haynes and Commissioner Beckner stated that the original wording was *lower* resident students’ relative share of college costs, rather than *stabilize* resident students’ relative share of college costs. They believed the word *lower* should be used, to make clear that the Commission thinks the ratio between student tuition and general fund dollars should be different, with the burden shifting away from the student. Commissioner Beckner also suggested that the phrase *through increases in state funding* be added to the end of *lower resident students’ relative share of college costs* and that the introductory statement in Goal 4 be changed from “Improve Productivity” to “Maintain Productivity.”

After much discussion about the tentative Goal 5, including the difficulty of attaching metrics for each institution to the goal and whether the goal should be incorporated into a strong preamble, the Commissioners voted on including Goal 5.

Commissioner Beckner moved to include the fifth goal in the Master Plan document. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Haynes and approved by a vote of four-to-two.

Lt Governor Garcia suggested the next course of action is to go back to the institutions and ask for their recommendations for objective, specific metrics they would be comfortable with and get this information to the Commission within a week to 10 days.

## **INFORMATION ITEMS**

**Financial Accountability Plan Update and Fiscal Year 2011-12 Tuition and Fees Report** – Mark Cavanaugh, Chief Financial Officer, told the Commission that there will not be a lot of changes to the Financial Accountability Plans (FAPs). Adams State College, Western State College and the University of Colorado’s Boulder and Denver institutions are *considering* changes to their FAPs. The FAP subcommittee will be meeting within the next week to discuss

the potential changes to the individual plans. The FY2011-12 Tuition and Fees Report highlighted a summary of tuition increases over the past five years, FY2007-08 to FY2011-12 and goes into great detail on tuition and fees. The Department has tried to increase the amount of information around tuition and fees and Mr. Cavanaugh believes this report is a significant improvement over last year's report, reflecting the importance since the advent of Senate Bill 10-003, which provides tuition flexibility through FY16.

**FY2011 Report On Educator Preparation To General Assembly** – Dr. Ian Macgillivray, Assistant Deputy Director for Academic Affairs, presented this report to the General Assembly to the Commission. Highlights of the report are:

Approved Ed Prep Programs

- 13,123 traditional candidates enrolled at 18 institutions of higher education.
- 643 alternative certification candidates enrolled at 33 designated agencies.
- Largest enrollments in Elementary Education (4,075), Special Education Generalist (1,379), Social Studies (1,189), and Culturally and Linguistically Diverse Education: ESL (1,166).

Educator ID System (HB 09-1065)

- Assign unique identifiers to educators allowing state to track them. Data may be used to:
  - Study effectiveness of educator training programs and mobility and retention issues;
  - Gather information about the percent of educators rated effective or not.

Education Evaluation System (SB10-191)

- Educators will be evaluated annually and rated on a continuum of effectiveness;
- 50% of teachers' evaluations will be based on student achievement;
- 50% of principals' evaluations will be based on school's student achievement and improvement in teacher effectiveness.

Report on Ed Prep Program Effectiveness (SB10-0360)

- DHE annually prepares a report on the effectiveness of educator preparation programs using data obtained through the Educator ID System.
- The report will analyze the correlation between different educator preparation programs, student academic growth, educator placement, and educator mobility and retention.
- Will be shared with the educator preparation programs to inform curriculum and program improvements.

**2011 Legislative Report On Remedial Education** – Dr. Beth Bean, Director of Research and Information, presented this report to the Commission. She pointed out some of the highlights, starting with a 3.2 percentage point increase in remedial rates overall. This translates to an 11 percent increase for the year. This can partially be explained by the increase in enrollment. The report shows remedial education by race and ethnicity. At the two year institutions, 85 percent of black, non-Hispanic student required remediation. At four year institutions, over 50 percent of black, non-Hispanic required remediation. At the at two year institutions, half of the white, non-Hispanic students needed remediation, whereas only 16 percent of white, non-Hispanic

students required remediation. At the two year institutions, 71 percent of Hispanic students needed remediation and 36 percent of Hispanic students needed remediation at the four year institutions. The report also shows an upward trend in first-time retention among students placed in remediation, in both two- and four-year institutions. The report also shows the number of innovative strategies currently used in the state. The \$1 million grant from Complete College America is being used to implement new strategies of remediation that are decreasing the time that students spend in remedial courses.

It was noted by both Dr. Bean and Mr. Cavanaugh that the estimated cost of remediation used in the past, will, going forward, be based on the individual institutions, rather than statewide, for more accurate representation of cost.

**Renewal Of Colorado-New Mexico Reciprocity Agreement** – Dr. Ian Macgillivray informed the Commission that the current agreement with New Mexico expires June 30, 2012. The department seeks to raise the current 400 full-time equivalent (FTE) enrollment cap to 500 FTE and renew the agreement for July 1, 2012 through June 30, 2015. The increase in FTE reflects the intentions of both Adams State College and Colorado State University-Pueblo to aggressively expand enrollments of students from New Mexico. There is no cost to the state associated with the agreement.

**Legislative Update** – Dr. Gianneschi discussed the status of upcoming legislation that impacts higher education.

HB12-1061 Skills for Jobs Act - Would require DHE to collaborate with the CDLE to create a report regarding gaps in degree attainment to jobs forecasted. Amended to clarify that the department will use data already collected to reasonably create this report. There is no fiscal note attached to this legislation.

HB12-1072 Higher Ed Prior Learning Assessments - As amended, requires the each public institution of higher education to have process and policy in place by 12-13 to assess credit for prior learning. The fiscal note for this legislation is close to \$1 million.

HB12-1155 Improvements in College Completion - The bill would encourage college completion by: 1) aligning admission and remedial policies; 2) enhances admission requirements through a collaborative process with the governing boards by taking account of the rigor of the high school courses taken and aligning the math requirement with the student's field of study; 3) allow supplemental instruction to students attending 4 year institutions as determined by CCHE; 4) reduce the COF eligible hours from 145 to 140; 5) removes COF eligibility and FA eligibility after two incompletes. This bill will be heard on February 22, 2012 and generally has a lot of support. There is no fiscal note attached to this legislation at this time.

SB12-045 Higher Ed Associate Degree Transfer Students - The bill would require 4-year institutions to inform 2 year institutions when a student who had transferred from the 2-year institution has accumulated 60 credits. The 2 year institution will then conduct a degree audit and

if the student has completed the necessary credits for an associate's degree will be rewarded unless the student declines it. Institutions will notify students of this option. DHE has a state data system for collecting records from across all the systems and could be responsible for notifying the institutions of students reaching a certain threshold of credit hours. This bill had passed through committee with a vote of 7-0 before the meeting ended.

HB12-1220 CSU Global Campus and CSU Board of Governors - The bill clarifies the Colorado State University Board of Governors control over the Colorado State University Global Campus. Also provides a distinct section for Global Campus in statute. This is considered a cleanup piece of legislation and rectifies the question of role and mission specific to an institution started within a system.

SB12-015 Creating Optional Category of Higher Ed Tuition - The bill provides an alternative tuition classification for students to receive a standard in-state rate of tuition. Provides an opt-out for governing boards of institutions that do not wish to participate.

The Commissioners modified the resolution brought to the CCHE by Matt Gettleman, with the Higher Education Access Alliance.

The resolution is below with the modifications (in boldface type below):

**Resolution in support of SB12-015 - Colorado ASSET - Advancing Students for a  
Stronger Economy Tomorrow**

**Regarding the Creation of an Optional Category of Tuition  
at State Institutions of Higher Education**

WHEREAS, students who have a reasonable hope of attending post secondary education are more likely to graduate from high school and thereby aid in narrowing the existing achievement gap between students from low socioeconomic families and students from higher socioeconomic families; and

WHEREAS, the Colorado Commission on Higher Education is committed to increasing its **state** graduation rates and having the highest possible percentage of its graduates attend post secondary education; and

WHEREAS, Colorado's economic growth and competitiveness requires a highly educated workforce; and

WHEREAS, under current Colorado state law, undocumented but otherwise qualified Colorado high school students face prohibitively high out-of-state tuition rates at state community colleges, four-year colleges, and universities which often prevents them from affording post secondary education; and

WHEREAS, denying post secondary access to Colorado's growing undocumented population means failing to capitalize on our current investments in their K-12 education; and

WHEREAS, providing equitable access to all Colorado high school graduates, including undocumented Colorado students who would otherwise qualify for in-state tuition for post secondary education will help to end discrimination; **motivate all students to pursue higher education opportunities in Colorado;**

**WHEREAS, Senate Bill 12-015 provides a new "standard-rate" tuition for qualifying students that would be higher than for other resident students to insure that no state Colorado Opportunity Funds (COF) dollars are allocated to support those qualifying students; and**

**WHEREAS, each Colorado higher education institution would have the right to opt-out of accepting students at the new standard-rate tuition.**

NOW, THEREFOR, BE IT RESOLVED, that the Colorado Commission on Higher Education strongly supports legislation to provide "standard rate" post secondary tuition to all Colorado high school graduates.

Commissioner Hayes moved to approve the modified resolution. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Scott and unanimously passed.

Commissioner Edwards moved to adjourn. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Haynes. The meeting was adjourned at 3:50 pm.