

Minutes of the Colorado Commission on Higher Education (CCHE) Meeting  
Colorado Community College System  
December 6, 2012

Chairman Kaufman called the meeting to order at 1:15pm.

Chairman Dick Kaufman, Vice Chair Patty Pacey, Commissioners Larry Beckner, Jeanette Garcia, Happy Haynes, Hereford Percy, Jim Polsfut, and BJ Scott attended. Commissioner Monte Moses attended via conference call. Also in attendance were CCHE Advisory Committee members Senator Evie Hudak, Toni Larson, Frank Novotny, Michael Mincic, Ruth Annette Carter, Mark Superka and Laura Rutz.

Commissioner Haynes congratulated Senator Hudak for assuming the chairmanship of the Senate Education Committee.

Commissioner Scott moved to approve the minutes of the November 1, 2012 CCHE meeting. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Garcia and passed unanimously.

Dr. Nancy McCallin, President of the Colorado Community College System (CCCS), welcomed the Commission to the campus. Dr. McCallin reported that the community college system has added nearly 41,000 students since FY 2006-07. Forty-seven percent of all minority undergraduate students attended one of the colleges; fifty-six percent are female; ninety-two percent are Colorado residents; and ninety-seven percent of all of the colleges graduating students stay in Colorado. The system has six core missions: open access; career and technical education; transfer of credits; concurrent enrollment; workforce development; and remedial and basic skills education. The CCCS, according to the National Center of Higher Education Management Systems (NCHEMS), has the sixth highest graduate rate for two year colleges among the nation as a whole.

**Partnership for Assessment of Readiness for College and Careers (PARCC) Assessment Design Presentation** – Emmy Glancy, Academic Policy Officer, along with Achieve staff members Allison Jones and Callie Riley, presented the development of a new assessment system designed to measure the Common Core State Standards as well as indicate to students, educators and higher education and businesses the extent to which the student is prepared for college or a career. Mr. Jones and Ms. Riley are project managers for the Partnership for Assessment of Readiness for College and Careers (PARCC), a consortium of 23 states plus the U.S. Virgin Islands working together to develop a common set of K-12 assessments in English and math anchored in what it takes to be ready for college and careers. To reflect the increased responsibility of higher education in the PARCC decision-making process, three members of the PARCC/Achieve Postsecondary Collaboration team are visiting Colorado to support deeper, targeted engagement with key decision makers and to strengthen higher education outreach and engagement plans.

The Colorado Department of Higher Education is focusing on three specific areas for employing the new assessments:

- 1) utilizing the PARCC college readiness determination in the statewide admission and Placement policy revisions;
- 2) aligning first-year credit-bearing coursework with new standards and assessments;
- 3) updating educator preparation programs to ensure the future teacher workforce is able to successfully implement the new standards and leverage the assessment data to improve student success.

In concert with the consortia states, the State Board of Education and CCHE have statutory authority to jointly adopt scoring criteria for the new assessments that are meaningful to both secondary and postsecondary practitioners.

Common core standards will be implemented in FY2014-15.

## **CHAIR REPORT**

Chairman Kaufman acknowledged out-going Commissioner Larry Beckner's five years of service on the Colorado Commission of Higher Education. Chairman Kaufman read a proclamation honoring Commissioner Beckner and thanked him for his service and commitment to education. Commissioner Beckner was also presented with a Colorado State Flag, flown at the State Capitol on November 28, 2012, from the Lt. Governor and the staff at the Department of Higher Education.

## **EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR REPORT**

Lt. Governor Joe Garcia, Executive Director of the Department of Higher Education, informed the Commission that Colorado is receiving a \$29.9 million Race to the Top federal grant, which will be used to enhance the quality of professionalism of the early childhood education centers.

Lt. Governor Garcia also reported that he will be attending the Complete College America conference in New Orleans, along with Chairman Kaufman and other members of the Colorado delegation to present remediation reform effort in Colorado.

The Lt Governor told the Commission that the department submitted a request for \$30 million in operating monies for higher education and \$5.3 million for need based financial aid, to the Joint Budget Committee for FY2013-14.

Also mentioned was the policy insights document from the Western Interstate Commission on Higher Education that highlights some of the legislation passed in Colorado recently, specifically SB52, which drives the master plan and performance contracts.

## **PUBLIC COMMENT**

Mr. John Marshall, Vice President for Student Services, at Colorado Mesa University (CMU), thanked the Commission for listening and accepting the feedback from CMU on the financial aid allocation methodology discussions. Appreciated is the focus on enrollment growth and the shared commitment to completion and retention by funding the retention bonus within the model. Mr. Marshall also appreciated the Commission not penalizing part time students in the methodology. CMU would like the model to consider more real time data collection of enrollments and to consider only awarding financial aid dollars to undergraduate students during this time of limited resources. Mr. Marshall also requested bringing private university state funding into conformity with the COF stipend approach which is fifty percent of the public rate.

## **CONSENT ITEMS**

**Approval of gtPathways Courses**

**Five-Year State Funded Capital Lists**

**Two-Year Cash Funded Capital Lists**

**Proposal to Offer a Bachelor of Arts in Computer Science at the University of Colorado**

**Proposal to Offer a Master of Science in Anesthesiology at the University of Colorado Denver**

**Proposal to Offer a Master of Science in Health Services Research, Policy and Administration at the University of Colorado Denver**

**Proposal to Offer a Bachelor of Arts in Ethnic Studies at the University of Colorado Denver**

**Proposal to Offer a Master of Arts in Arts Leadership and Administration at Colorado State University**

**Approval to Offer Culturally and Linguistically Diverse Education Endorsement Program at Regis University, Regis College for Professional Studies**

Commissioner Percy moved to approve the consent items. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Scott and unanimously passed.

## **ACTION ITEMS**

**Facilities Master Plan Review for the University of Colorado-Colorado Springs (UCCS) –** Tonya Gomez, Financial Policy Officer, along with Gary Reynolds, UCCS Executive Director of Facilities Services, and Vice Chancellor of Administration and Finance, Brian D. Burnett presented the updated and revised Facilities Master Plans, for the Commission's approval. The Board of Regents approved the Master Plan for UCCS in September 2012. The plan was submitted for CCHE review in October 2012. The CCHE Capital Assets Sub-Committee reviewed the Plan in November 2012 and Department of Higher Education staff took a tour of the UCCS campus on November 20, 2012.

Some of the basic goals of the 2012 Master Plan are:

- Accommodate enrollment growth within a development framework that unifies the campus;
- Evaluate the responsible capacity of North Campus at full build-out and create a plan that respects that capacity in a sustainable manner;
- Integrate university development on the North Campus with adjacent development on North Nevada Avenue within the Urban Renewal Zone; and
- Develop an implementation plan that aligns with goals set by the university's Strategic Plan for 2020.

The 2012 Master Plan submission is guided by the following principles:

- Respect Natural Features
- Reinforce Vibrant Campus Anchors
- Connect Campus Destinations

The Plan's principal basis for determining the facility and space needs is student enrollment based on assumptions and goals in the Strategic Plan for 2020. The projection takes into account past enrollment growth, Colorado population increases, and the increase in people choosing to pursue higher education.

Commissioner Haynes moved to approve the Master Plan for the University of Colorado at Colorado Springs. The motion was seconded by Vice Chair Pacey and unanimously passed.

**Recommendation to Reverse the CCHE Decision that Prohibits Institutions of Higher Education from Offering Bachelor's Degrees in all Education Fields** - Dr. Ian Macgillivray, Assistant Deputy Director For Academic Affairs, presented this item recommending that the Commission reverse its March 24, 1986 decision not to recognize education majors at the bachelor's level in any education field. After reversing this decision for Early Childhood Education at its April 5, 2012 and Elementary Education at its June 7, 2012 meetings, it was pointed out that some institutions offer bachelor's degrees in other education fields, like Special Education. This action would formally clarify that institutions of higher education may offer bachelor's degrees in any education field.

A review of current baccalaureate programs in the state with "education" in the degree name (besides bachelor's degrees in Early Childhood and Elementary Education) revealed the following programs:

- Music Education,
- Agricultural Education,
- Human Performance and Physical Education, and
- Special Education.

The deans and directors of education in the Colorado Council of Deans of Education were in favor of reversing the CCHE decision.

Commissioner Garcia moved to reverse its March, 1986 decision and allow institutions of higher education to offer bachelor's degrees in all education fields. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Haynes and unanimously passed.

**Supplemental Academic Instruction Policy** – Vice Chair Pacey motioned to move this Action Item to the Discussion Items. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Haynes and unanimously passed.

## **INFORMATION ITEM**

**FY 2012 Financial Aid Allocation Report** - Celina Duran, Financial Aid Officer, presented the 2012 report that annually goes to the Joint Budget Committee (JBC) and the House and Senate Education Committees. Although the Long Bill footnote no longer mandates the report, the JBC has requested the Department continue reporting the financial aid expenditures. Highlights of the report include:

- The total number of students in Colorado receiving financial aid in FY 2012 increased by two and a half percent (+2.5%) over FY 2011 to 230,165.
- Half of all students who received financial assistance in FY 2012 received a Pell grant.
- In FY 2012, federal grant aid accounted for 40 percent of all grant aid in Colorado. Pell grants alone accounted for 36 percent of total grant aid and 16 percent of all aid.
- State funded financial aid comprised slightly more than ten percent (10%) of all grant aid and more than five percent (5%) of all aid, including federal loans.
- Institutional aid accounted for 43 percent (43%) of all grant aid and 20 percent (20%) of all aid, including federal loans.
- The average student loan debt for baccalaureate graduates was \$24,850 in 2011-12, and ranged from \$20,794 to \$30,987.

## **DISCUSSION ITEMS**

**Master Plan Update** – Dr. Matt Gianneschi, Deputy Executive Director, presented the Commission's statewide master plan, titled "Colorado Competes: A Completion Agenda for Higher Education" for official endorsement from the CCHE.

Commissioner Haynes moved to adopt and affirm the official master plan. The motion was seconded by Vice Chair Pacey and unanimously passed.

Dr. Gianneschi then presented four different performance contracts, prepared by the Office of the Attorney General. One is for public colleges and universities (excluding the Colorado School of Mines); one is for the Colorado School of Mines, as this institution's performance contract is governed by slightly different statutes than other public universities; one is for private colleges and universities that participate in the College Opportunity Fund (COF), the University of Denver, Regis University, and Colorado Christian University; and one for area vocations colleges and local district colleges. The contract given to the Commissioners will be the body of the contract. The agreed upon performance criteria for each school will be Addendum A of the

contract and institutional flexibility will be addendum B. The only response for flexibility came from the community college system regarding capital planning.

The next step in the performance contract process is the performance metrics that the institutions are developing. All but one institution has submitted their metrics, but the department has had an initial meeting with that institution and its board. In this instance, questions regarding performance metrics remain, but these are under active consideration and will be completed very soon. In addition, all of the private colleges and universities that participate in the College Opportunity Fund program are in receipt of the revised performance contracts and the “performance metric worksheet” used by the state’s public colleges and universities, and meetings with representatives from these campuses have been or are being planned.

There will be an additional item added to the performance contracts called Program Discontinuance. This policy will allow the Commission to notify the institution’s governing board that an offered program has fallen below a certain level over several years and should be shut down.

The President of Colorado School of Mines, Bill Scoggins, submitted a letter to the department suggesting the metrics in the performance contracts be revisited in two years after they go into effect in 2013, to see whether the indicators are still appropriate after the contracts have been implemented. He suggested that this should be done one year before the actual performance funding goes into effect.

**Financial Aid Allocation Discussion** – Celina Duran, presented the final discussion about the financial aid allocation method for FY 2013-14. The Commission will approve changes to the method at its January 2013 meeting. Since the August 2012 introduction to possible changes in the allocation for financial aid, the following modifications have been endorsed:

1. Targeting allocations to Pell eligible FTE
2. Eliminating financial “tiers” among institutions (moving to “flat” or common award levels)
3. Introducing progressive award “steps” to incent and promote retention and momentum
4. Introducing financial “disincentives” for continuing students that do not complete in a timely manner
5. Creating greater year-over-year predictability for financial aid administrators
6. Maintaining institutional flexibility to award state grant aid to students currently receiving awards (i.e., resident students with up to 150% of the Pell EFC

The Commission was presented with two different models. Model A Progressive Model, Hold Harmless Plus Inflation and Model B Progressive Model, No Hold Harmless. Both models employ a progressive allocation method using data from the FY 2012 SURDS financial aid file. Any changes to the state’s financial aid policy will always lead to variability in allocation levels at the institution level. As a result, Department staff recommend implementing an initial “hold harmless” provision in the first year of the new program. Commissioners favored the “hold harmless” (Model A), as FY 2013-14 will be a transition year which will result in no dollars being lost the first year.

Jeff Barratt, Executive Director of the Emily Griffith Opportunity School, addressed the Commission representing Emily Griffith Opportunity School, Pickens Technical College and Delta Montrose Technical College. Mr. Barratt explained that the three Area Vocational Schools (AVS) rely on general fund dollars, tuitions and fees. They do not receive COF funding nor do they receive Amendment 50 monies that the community colleges receive. Collectively, the three institutions award about 35 percent of all certificates in Colorado. Emily Griffith's completion rate is 79 percent for full time students and 68 percent for part time students.

Mr. Barrett requested reconsideration on the financial aid allocation model allocated to the three area vocational schools. He noted that the AVSs are the only public schools not included in the allocation model. They are included in a block grant, which is close to approximately \$100 per student. He states that financial aid has been flat or in some cases, decreasing. Mr. Barratt proposed a reconsideration of that financial aid allocation by being thrust in with their peer group; the community college system that have cohort groups of certificate programs.

Dr. Gianneschi reported the department has made a commitment to Mr. Barratt and his colleagues at Pickens Technical College and Delta Montrose Technical College to try to estimate what the impact for students would be if, instead of a block grant, financial aid awards at the student level were based on the availability of Pell, the total cost for the student and the role the state financial aid plays. Any change should be equitable to the AVSs and the community colleges. Monies allocated to one group will have to come out of the allocation for another. Any adjustment will have to be well understood and well documented. There discussions will continue over the next few weeks with the AVSs.

**Supplemental Academic Instruction Policy Discussion** – Tamara White, Director of Admission and Access Policy, presented this item for discussion. House Bill 12-1155 and C.R.S. 23-1-113(1.5) give the Colorado Commission on Higher Education the authority to grant authorization to state supported institutions to offer Supplemental Academic Instruction(SAI). Institutions operating under the SAI policy would be granted narrow relief from the Commission's Statewide Remedial Education policy (CCHE Policy I, E) for students who meet the institution's minimum admission standards, but have an assessment result below the remedial placement "cut score." The introduction to the policy clarifies that the policy was designed to provide flexibility for the CCHE Remedial Education Policy and offers support for students with limited academic deficiencies. The introduction also clarifies that institutions authorized to offer supplemental academic instruction are eligible to receive COF stipends for credit bearing supplemental academic instruction.

A Supplemental Academic Instruction (SAI) subcommittee was established with representation from many of the state's public postsecondary institutions. The subcommittee was coordinated and supported by staff in the department.

The definitions in the policy are taken directly from statute, save for two definitions; 2.05 Credit-Bearing Supplemental Academic Instruction and 2.06 Non-Credit-Bearing Supplemental Academic Instruction. The institutions state that the clarifications between the two definitions were very important. The credit bearing SAI means credit-bearing co-requisite instruction in English or mathematics for students with limited academic deficiencies that accompany credit-

bearing college level, general education English and/or mathematics courses approved for statewide transfer. Institutions will determine if SAI credits will be considered towards a degree. Authorized institutions will be eligible to receive COF stipends. The noncredit-bearing SAI means noncredit-bearing co-requisite instruction in English or mathematics that accompany credit-bearing college level courses in English and math. Noncredit-bearing SAI will *not* be eligible for COF stipend payments. The department will be able to monitor students both in credit-bearing SAI and noncredit-bearing SAI.

Prior to this Supplemental Academic Instruction (SAI) policy, a student admitted into a four-year institution who scored a few points below the cut scores was required to go into remedial instruction, either at a community college or, if available, on their campus, but on a “cash funded” basis (i.e., without state financial support). This policy will allow these same students to remain at their home institution and complete their general education course with SAI support. The goal of this policy is to accelerate timely completion and eliminate unnecessary policy barriers to credit accumulation. This policy will allow state institutions the opportunity to offer courses to support students with limited academic deficiencies expands opportunities for students who only require a minimal amount of academic support by enabling them to immediately enter into credit-bearing courses with SAI support.

Institutions that request authorization will submit a proposal to the Commission indicating how they plan to implement SAI. This proposal will include information about SAI assessment, cut scores, intervention/support processes, and evaluation measures. Institutions will receive a preliminary three-year authorization, after which they will be re-evaluated on the success of their implementation of SAI based on student outcomes. An annual report will be produced and shared with the Commission.

Approximately 30% of all newly enrolled students in Colorado require some form of remedial support. At the four-year level, approximately 20% of newly enrolled students require remediation. There is growing evidence that students with modest remedial needs should not be placed in full developmental courses. Department staff believe that the changes to Commission policy permitted by this SAI policy will lead to improvements in academic persistence and credit accumulation for students throughout Colorado. Moreover, the SAI policy will assist four-year institutions in achieving the goals of the CCHE Master Plan, specifically improving credit hour accumulation and closing gaps in performance between underserved and non-underserved students.

Commissioner Percy moved to adjourn. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Beckner. The meeting was adjourned at 5:00 pm.